

# **National Educational Strategy in Lebanon**

---

---

## **Vision Document**

---

---

**Prepared by  
Lebanese Association for Educational Studies**

**Final Version**

20/12/2006

# **PART I: VISION AND MISSION**

## **I. The Vision**

---

---

**The Vision: Education in Lebanon available on the basis of equal opportunity; education that has good quality and contributes to building an information society, to social integration, and to economic development.**

---

---

### **Education Available on the Basis of Equal Opportunity**

1. Education available to children aged 3-5; public education accessible to this age group.
2. Compulsory Basic Education until the age of 15; the state should give access to public education for all, based on the right of every individual to quality education. Education should give everyone, including learners with special needs, equal opportunity for enrollment, for educational continuation and for success.
3. Secondary Education (general and technical) available equally: in enrollment, educational continuation, and success and in which students would be given the chance to choose among academic and technical education specializations and the opportunity to choose elective courses in order to reinforce their autonomy and to help them improve their educational and career choices.
4. Higher Education (including technical education) available equally and organized in a manner that allows for academic mobility among its various sectors and institutions, provides support for students, and adapts to new trends and student needs.

### **Quality Education that Contributes to Building a Knowledge Society**

5. Education characterized by the high quality of its curricula, institutions, and outcomes; an education that is aligned with national and international standards.
6. Education oriented towards the development of knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for handling information and the intensive use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT).
7. Education that develops the general education of individuals and provides them with critical thinking skills and moral reasoning, enabling them to live and work in a modern, changing society and to become lifelong learners.

### **Education that Contributes to Social Integration**

8. Education that develops citizenship in its three dimensions: National identity, civic participation, and human partnership.
9. Education that contributes to social cohesion and provides learners with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for living together in a diverse society.
10. Education that contributes to social mobility: horizontally, among geographical locations and vertically, among social strata.
11. Education that contributes to the social inclusion of dropouts and individuals marginalized inside the school as well as to the prevention of social marginalization.

### **Education that Contributes to Economic Development**

12. Education that contributes to the development of human capital.
13. Education that provides qualitatively and quantitatively competent work force to meet the needs of the Lebanese labor market, and that can compete in free job markets.

## **II. The Mission**

---

---

**The Mission: The Ministry of Education and Higher Education looks after the public interest in both the public and the private educational sectors and manages public education in order to ensure that education is available on the basis of equal opportunity, has good quality, and contributes to building a knowledge society, to social integration, and to economic development.**

---

---

## Part I: Education Available on the Basis of Equal Opportunity

---

---

### 1. Education available to children aged 3-5; public education accessible to this age group.

---

---

1. The net enrollment rate in preschools for children aged 3-5 reached 77.7%<sup>1</sup> for the academic year 2004-2005. Although the rate reaches 79.6% for children 5 years of age, it goes down to 72.2% for children 4 years of age and to a meager 26.6% for children 3 years of age. The absence of a clear official commitment to incorporate three-year old children in the educational ladder and the consequent absence of a nursery class from most public preschools are the major reasons behind this low percentage of school enrollment among three-year-old children.
2. The non-free private educational sector attracts the highest percentage of the total number of students (61.9%), compared to only 22.7% in the public sector, and 15.4% in the subsidized private sector<sup>2</sup>. This disproportion among the various educational sectors is highlighted in the case of the schooling of three-year-old children where 82% of them are enrolled in the non-free private sector, and only 5% are enrolled in the public sector despite the fact that the average number of students in a class in public schools is 14 students, which means that certain schools are able to take in additional students.
3. There is geographical inequality in enrollment. The net enrollment rate reaches 91.8% in Mount Lebanon, and slides down gradually to 81.9% in Beirut, to 79.2% in Bekaa, to 71.4% in Nabatiyeh, to 68.7% in the North, and to 59% in the South<sup>3</sup>. While the highest enrollment rates in private schools are in the area of Beirut and Mount Lebanon (69-81% approximately), residents of other regions head mostly towards the public and the free private preschools (42-56% approximately).
4. With respect to gender, the proportion of males to females is similar among 3, 4, and 5-year-old children in preschools, and this applies to all sectors (non-free private, public, and subsidized private).
5. There is a relationship between the quality of preschool and the opportunities to enroll in it in such a way that<sup>4</sup> preschools with better quality education are located mainly in the districts of Beirut and Mount Lebanon and have higher tuition fees<sup>5</sup>.
6. Despite initiatives taken by some private schools to accommodate children with special needs, most private and public schools still do not possess the basic requirements needed for educating these children.

**1/1 ➤ A large percentage of children aged 3-5 remain outside kindergartens, especially those aged 3 and those with special needs. Public education does not provide enough opportunities for children to join kindergartens that meet minimum quality requirements especially in areas outside Beirut and Mount Lebanon.**

---

---

**2. Compulsory Basic Education until the age of 15; the state should give access to public education for all, based on the right of every individual to quality education. Education should give everyone, including learners with special needs, equal opportunity for enrollment, for educational continuation and for success.**

---

---

### **A. Enrollment**

7. Enrollment in schools stands at near-saturation in elementary education, where the average net enrollment rate reached 97% during the academic year of 2004-2005<sup>6</sup>. However, the average net enrollment rate dwindles to a meager 68.5 %<sup>7</sup> in intermediate education (excluding few in the CAP and CP certificates<sup>8</sup>). This indicates that, by the end of the elementary cycle, a huge number of students drop out or lag behind in their studies.
8. Basic education in Lebanon extends to grade 9 which corresponds to age 15. However, compulsory education, according to Law No. 686 (16/3/1998), stops at age 12. Moreover, this law is yet to be applied.
9. The private sector remains the main provider for basic education in Lebanon. Thus, the total number of students in basic education for the year 2004-2005 was 650,666, among whom 37% were enrolled in public schools, 14% in subsidized private schools, and 49% in non-free private schools.
10. Differences among sexes are slight and tend to favor of females. There is a 4% difference in the average net enrollment rate for elementary school (95% males vs. 99% females) and a 9% difference at the intermediate level (55% vs. 64%). As for enrollment in schools, and regardless of age, females constitute 48% of elementary education students and 52.2% of intermediate education students<sup>9</sup>. This means that the phenomena of lagging behind in school and dropping out by the end of elementary school applies to males more than to females. In addition, the percentage of females in public schools (52%) is larger than that in private schools (48%); the percentage of females reaches its peak (58%) in grade 9 in public schools.
11. There is geographical inequality in the net enrollment rate. In elementary education, the rate drops from 97% at the national level to 50% in the North, Bekaa, and South. This means that educational opportunities are not as available in those three areas as they are in Mount Lebanon and Beirut. The gap between the sexes remains practically the same for all cycles in all regions.

**1/2 ➤ Enrollment in elementary education in Lebanon stands at near-saturation level (97%). But this percentage drops in intermediate education to 68.5 %. This deficiency in providing basic education to all goes hand in hand with discrepancies among geographical locations and with low enrollment in public education (34%).**

### **B. Educational Continuation**

12. In the past decades, Lebanon witnessed a great improvement in opportunities for educational continuation. Out of a cohort group of 1000 students who enroll in grade 1 of elementary school, 593 drop out of school before grade 12 according to the estimated

percentages of 1997-1998 compared to 810 dropouts in 1972-1973. The rate of dropping out at the end of the elementary cycle has remarkably dropped from 21.3% to 3.3% in those two years respectively<sup>10</sup>.

13. Opportunities for educational continuation still face a number of challenges. The first such challenge is the dropout rate, which takes place beginning in grade 1, and ranges between 0.5% to 3.4% during elementary school; this rate increases to around 4-5% in intermediate school and reaches 27% in grade 9 (Brevet). The second challenge is repetition of classes which reached a percentage of 10% in elementary schools for 2004-2005, going as high as 17.9% in grade 4. The rate of class repetition is 13.5% in intermediate school, reaching as high as 20.3% in grade 7<sup>11</sup>. The third challenge facing educational continuation concerns class retardation (students aged more than their class age); their rate reaches 24.2% in elementary school and 41% in intermediate school. This situation worsens when moving from one cycle to the other; thus, the rate jumps from 19% in grade 3 to 31% in grade 4, to 35% in grade 6, and reaches 41% in grade 7<sup>12</sup>.
14. With respect to gender, females are better positioned than males; the percentage of educational continuation for females exceeds that of males<sup>13</sup> for all classes. The percentage of females promoted to intermediate school is higher than that of males; and the percentage of female dropouts is much lower than that of males in all of Lebanon.
15. With respect to geographical districts, the rate of dropouts and repetition is higher in the North, Bekaa, and South as compared to Beirut and Mount Lebanon<sup>14</sup>.
16. Opportunities for educational continuation in the private educational sector are better than opportunities in the public sector. The rate of class retardation reaches 24% in elementary school as an average for both sectors. In the public sector, however, it reaches 41.6% in elementary school. At the intermediate school, the average for both sectors is 41.1%, and it reaches 61.2% for the public sector. In grades 4 and 7, the rate reaches 52% and 61% respectively<sup>15</sup>. Moreover, the percentages of dropouts and repeaters are higher in the public sector<sup>16</sup>.
17. The July 2006 war resulted in destroying 40 schools completely and 300 schools partially<sup>17</sup>. This resulted in delay in opening some schools, or the transfer of students from destroyed buildings to schools and buildings that are either far or follow short schedule (dual schedule). The school life was disrupted for those whose homes were destroyed, or who lost their whole family or some family members, or those whose lives have been impacted by war and its consequences. Vis-à-vis the gravity of such problems which seriously affect educational continuation, the MEHE structure does not include specialized unit for student guidance and counseling. The public school does not have counseling services as well.

**1/3 ➤ There are serious problems with educational continuation that manifest themselves in the high percentages of dropout and class repetition and retardation; such problems reach their peak in the 4<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> grades. There are no significant gender differences, and when such differences exist, they tend to be in favor of females. But there are significant differences among the various districts in favor of Beirut and Mount Lebanon; there are also significant differences between the public and private sectors, in favor of the latter. The July 2006 war is probably going to aggravate the problems of educational continuation in some areas.**

### C. Opportunities for Success in Official Exams

18. Opportunities for passing the official exams at the end of grade 9 (Brevet) increased in the last few years, especially after the implementation of the new curricula. Opportunities for passing the official exams are higher among females and are in favor of Beirut and Mount Lebanon. As for sector differences, opportunities for passing official exams are in favor of the private sector. However, it should be noted that there is no homogeneity within the private sector as the results of students on official examinations in foreign language show<sup>18</sup>.

**1/4 ➤ There is inequality in opportunity of success for passing official examinations between private and public educational sectors.**

### D. Students with special needs

19. The majority of schools are not fit to accommodate students with special needs; the deficiencies relate to availability of necessary facilities, regarding proper equipment, buildings, special teaching aids, and qualified special education educators. On the other hand, the gifted are not taken care of in the two cycles of basic education. Even though there are modest number of initiatives in this respect, these initiatives lack proper follow-up and expansion.

**1/5 ➤ The educational system does not provide enough measures that cater to students with special needs (retarded and gifted) through the provision of educational material and human resources needed to develop their diverse abilities and to integrate them with their peers.**

---

---

**3. Secondary Education (general, vocational and technical) available equally: in enrollment, educational continuation, and success. Students would be given the chance to choose among academic and technical education specializations and the opportunity to choose elective courses in order to reinforce their autonomy and to help them improve their educational and career choices.**

---

---

### A. Enrollment

20. The percentage of 15-19 year olds enrolled in school is 71%<sup>19</sup>. However, a little over half of those enrolled (52.3% of them) are found in secondary education; the rest are distributed between intermediate school (31.3%) and higher education (16.5%). If the analysis were restricted to the 15-17 age group, the typical age of students in secondary school (both general and vocational education), the net enrollment rate would be estimated at around 50%<sup>20</sup>, which is considered to be low compared to developed countries.
21. There is gender inequality in terms of enrollment in secondary education in favor of girls. The enrollment rate for the 15-19 age group drops from 74% for females to 67% for males. There are also geographical inequalities, where the enrollment rate stands at 79% in Beirut as composed to 65% in the South, Bekaa, and North. The difference in the

enrollment rate in secondary school between the sexes increases from 2% in Beirut to 10% in the North and South<sup>21</sup>.

22. The number of students enrolled in secondary education (general and vocational) is 1556,891<sup>22</sup>. Of these students, the public school system accommodates 50.1% of secondary education students (53% general education, 46% vocational education).
23. The difference between the private and public sectors is caused by the discrepancies that exist among the tracks students join. In general secondary education, private school students have more chances of joining the scientific tracks whereas public school students are more likely to enroll in the humanities sociology and economics tracks. There is a 15 to 30%<sup>23</sup> difference in the chances of joining the scientific tracks between the public and the private sectors. As for vocational education, the chance of joining industrial and agricultural specializations is higher in public education than in private education; business and service specializations are more popular in the latter<sup>24</sup>. Moreover, the chances of enrollment in certificate programs that extend from three months to one year are higher in the private sector than in the public one. The students enrolled in programs which lead only to attestation constitute 38% of students in the private sector and 0% in the public sector.

**1/6 ➤ Secondary education (general and technical) is reasonably available with an enrollment covering 50% of the population aged 15-17, but this ratio remains below the enrollment rates in developed countries and in some Arab countries as well. Gender inequality in opportunities of enrollment is not significant; however, geographical inequality is significant. Enrollment in public education attracts a little less than 50% of the student body and is distributed almost equally between general education (53%) and technical education (46%). The percentage of those who join public education is higher outside Beirut compared to Beirut.**

## **B. Educational Continuation**

24. The new educational framework in Lebanon did away with the Baccalaureate part I (administered at the end of the second year of secondary school) which was considered a major obstacle in the face of students trying to finish secondary school. Class retardation - which could be due to late enrollment, class repetition in previous cycles, or repetition in the secondary cycle - remains the major problem in the secondary cycle. The rate of class retardation reaches its peak (42.6%) in grade 12, the last class in the cycle. This rate reaches 34% in the first class (grade 10) and 33% in the second class (grade 11).
25. The inequality in educational continuity is due to class retardation among boys, and it is more frequent within the public sector where it reaches 48.7% in the whole cycle and 56.1% in the third secondary. Furthermore, class retardation occurs more often in vocational and technical education than it does in general education.

## **C. Success in Official Exams**

26. The rate of passing official exams is estimated at 70%. This rate applies to both general education and technical education. While this rate is considered satisfactory, it remains lower than what it is supposed to be.
27. Discrepancies exist as far as the rate of passing the official examinations is concerned: 1) between the private and the public sectors, in favor of the private sector; 2) among the various academic tracks, where the highest success rate is in the general sciences track



followed by that in life sciences, that in sociology and economics, and finally that in the humanities tracks; 3) between sexes, in favor of girls in all tracks; and 4) between English-educated and French-educated students, in favor of English-educated students in all tracks. The rate of success does not vary by geographical location<sup>25</sup>.

**1/7 ➤ There is inequality between private and public sectors in terms of opportunity of success in passing the official examinations, which tends to favor the private sector and which is related to high class retardation rate in the public sector.**

#### **D. The structure of Secondary Education**

28. Secondary Education branches into two separate tracks: general education and vocational education. Each of these tracks includes several sub tracks starting in the first year of vocational education and in the second year of general education. Every track or specialty has a set curriculum made up of required courses for all students of the track. Students are tested in all these courses at school, then at the official exams at the end of the third year of secondary school. This rigid system in both vocational and general education has a built-in element of inequality as it unifies educational offerings for students with different aptitudes. The system does not offer students the opportunity to choose elective courses that suit their inclinations, or to take remedial courses and advanced level courses. Since the system does not give the student the opportunity to choose, the student is denied the opportunity to engage in independent thinking, and to make the proper educational and career choices. Moreover, secondary schools in general, and public schools (general and vocational) in particular, lack career guidance programs that help students make the proper educational and career choices.

**1/8 ➤ There is no comprehensive system for secondary education. The current system remains divided into separate tracks, first, between general and technical education and, second, among the specializations in each. This rather inflexible structure adds to inequality (in enrollment, continuation of study, and success) as it deprives students of opportunities for choice of courses, taking remedial and advanced courses, and of educational mobility.**

---

---

#### **4. Higher Education (including technical education), available equally and organized in a manner that allows for academic mobility among its various sectors and institutions, provides support for students, and adapts to new trends and student needs.**

---

---

29. If we estimate that the population of Lebanon was about four million people in 2005, then the average number of students enrolled in higher education (including technical education) would be 4143 per 100,000 habitants. This average is one of the highest in the Arab region. In addition, the average enrollment rate in education for the 20-24 years age group<sup>26</sup> is 29.7%, with about 1/4 of those enrolled in pre-university education. However, these two averages (in relation to the general population and to the age group in question) remain below the averages in developed countries (Europe and North America), and in newly-industrialized nations (South Korea for example).

30. There are no significant gender differences with respect to enrollment in higher education, yet, in recent years, the number of females enrolled in higher education has surpassed that of males (54% vs. 46%). However, discrepancies in the rate of enrollment in higher education continue with respect to geographical locations: the enrollment rate for the 20-24 years age group reaches 37.6% in Beirut and 36.8% in Mount Lebanon, but it dwindles to 27-28% in the North and South and to a mere 21% in the Bekaa and Nabatiyeh.
31. There are geographical inequalities in enrollment rates between the public and private sectors. The private sector encompasses 42 higher education institutions, including 18 universities<sup>27</sup>. The public sector relies on one university only, the Lebanese University (LU). In the academic year 1999-2001, 60.3% of higher education students were enrolled at LU. Later on, and after a number of private institutions were licensed in 1996, the LU share dropped to 49.5% in the academic year 2004-2005. The distinctive characteristic of the LU is mainly its presence in most Lebanese regions. Of the total number of students enrolled at LU, 43% are in the South, North, and Bekaa regions<sup>28</sup>, where it is rare to find private universities and colleges, with the exception of Balamand University in the North. The branches of other private universities (St. Joseph, Notre Dame, and others) in the regions outside Beirut and Mount Lebanon, serve very small numbers of students. As for technical colleges that grant T.S. and BA/BS degrees, they are mainly located within Beirut and its suburbs (56% of public schools' students and 61% of private schools' students)<sup>29</sup>.
32. There is an inequality in enrollment between public and private sectors in relation to available fields of specialization. The majority of Lebanese University students are enrolled in Humanities (60.25%) versus 20.7% of students in the private sector<sup>30</sup>. In higher technical education, there is no difference in number of students between the private and public sectors at the level of the T.S. diploma (3 years); however, the L.T. diploma (5 years) is offered only at public institutes/colleges. It is to be noted that industrial specializations, as in secondary technical education, are mainly present in the public sector.

**1/9 ➤ Opportunities to pursue higher education remain less available in Lebanon than in developed countries and in recently industrialized nations. Although there are no gender differences in the availability of these opportunities, the differences among geographical locations remain high.**

33. There is inequality in educational continuation between private and public sectors. Unlike private universities the Lebanese University experiences a large number of registered students in the first year there in Humanities specializations including law, political sciences, social sciences, and literature (57.3% in 2003/2004). The discrepancy in educational continuation opportunities among the two sectors is manifested in the number of graduates. The number of registered students in both sectors is equal (49.5% versus 50.5% in year 2004-2005), but the number of graduates is higher in the private sector (58.4% versus 41.6% in year 2003-2004). There are some further discrepancies which are related to quality of education offered. These discrepancies are relative and depend on the specialization, college, university, and on whether the university has an open admission policy or a selective policy based on entrance examinations. At any rate, a study by the Lebanese Association for Educational Sciences conducted in 1997 identified some of these discrepancies<sup>31</sup>. Even though this study is relatively old, its findings about the Lebanese University were corroborated by later studies<sup>32</sup>.

**1/10 ➤ There is inequality in educational continuation between the Lebanese University and the private universities and among fields of study. This inequality relates to differences in educational quality as well as to differences in internal efficiency among sectors and specializations.**

34. The support that higher education institutions offer to their students takes different forms: 1) offering advising services for students wishing to attend university, such as providing information about entrance examinations; 2) offering financial aid and scholarships, which may reach in very few cases up to 100%; 3) offering intensive courses to support students in basic subjects, such as foreign languages and computer literacy, which are intended to improve the performance level of students in certain fields; 4) assigning an advisor for each group of students to help them make better academic choices; and 5) having a public relations and information office to advise students on the positions available on the job market. We might find all these services or some of them in one university or the other, and we might find other services as well. However, comprehensive support systems are not available at the Lebanese university and at many of the private universities.

**1/11 ➤ Higher education, except for few exceptions, lacks the ability and the preparedness to offer student support services that could improve students' opportunities of enrollment, help them cover the cost of their education, improve their chances to continue their studies, and improve their choices of courses and fields of study.**

35. Academic mobility within higher education in Lebanon is highly limited, and there are plenty of reasons for this lack of academic communication among universities. First, universities in Lebanon are characterized by cultural diversity, in the literal sense, where some universities are Francophone while others are either Anglophone or Arabic-speaking universities. The Lebanese University started as a Francophone university, then, most of its Humanities curricula were taught in Arabic in the 1960s. Nowadays, some branches use the French language while others use English. Secondly, the universities have different systems (in curricula, examinations, and courses offered as well as in course descriptions); this diversity is the result of different educational-cultural backgrounds (Francophone or Anglophone) which later on took on a variety of forms such as Francophone, Anglophone, Arabic/Egyptian, Islamic, Lebanese or a mixture of these. The Lebanese University, with its faculties and branches, is the most diversified and heterogeneous institution with respect to these systems. It is the university that lacks a clear academic identity<sup>33</sup>. The general picture is one of a heterogeneous and unrelated mixture of systems that lead to reducing the opportunities for academic mobility within higher education. In the past few years, Saint Joseph University has changed its system to the European LMD system which makes it closer to the Anglo-Saxon system. The Lebanese University started a similar program, but it has not completed it yet. As a result, all the efforts exerted had not led to a serious improvement in the opportunities for academic mobility.
36. Higher technical education, at the post-secondary level, with its different degrees (TS diploma, Bachelor's, etc...) has an independent academic and administrative organizational structure (General Directorate for Vocational and Technical Education). Curricular development and examinations are done in a centralized fashion, in a manner similar to what happens in the secondary cycle. This centralization is a barrier between

technical and vocational education on the one hand and universities and colleges, on the other.

**1/12 ➤ There is no comprehensive system for higher education where definitions of curricula, degrees, and courses are agreed upon in such a way that would allow for academic mobility among institutions of higher education.**

## Part II: Quality Education that contributes to Building the Knowledge Society

---

---

### 5. Education characterized by the high quality of its curricula, institutions, and outcomes; an education that is aligned with national and international standards.

---

---

#### A. Pre-School Education

1. The new ladder for general education in Lebanon led to two problems in pre-school education: 1) it built the curriculum of elementary education in such a way that a child could join the first grade without having gone through kindergarten; this has resulted in discontinuity between pre-school and elementary curricula; 2) it did not designate a class for the age group 3-4, despite the importance of starting education early. A Ministerial decree added this class without specifying a curriculum for it, which caused confusion in the schools.
2. The new curriculum for pre-school education has many positive characteristics, such as following activity-based learning and adopting a thematic approach with instructional units under each theme. On the other hand, the curriculum suffers from problems related to learning reading, writing, foreign language, mathematics, psychomotor activities, and technology<sup>34</sup>. There is also confusion about the concept of “mother language” in a curriculum that is too general<sup>35</sup>. In fact, while all public pre-school educational institutions follow this curriculum, most free and non-free private institutions follow it only in part<sup>36</sup>.
3. The percentage of specialized teachers - holding university or vocational preparation degrees - who work in pre-school is less than 30.6% of all pre-school teachers. It is important to point out that, as of the year 2002, it is illegal to “appoint or give an individual a contract for a teacher position unless that individual is a holder of a bachelor’s degree from a recognized institution”<sup>37</sup>. But the law does not explicitly state that this degree should be in elementary or pre-school education.
4. In most cases, a pre-school is part of the general education (especially elementary) teaching facilities with common playgrounds for students of all ages. Non-free private schools use educational aids more than the other schools while public schools make extensive use of teaching materials that are cheaper, less technical, and may be constructed by teachers themselves. Free private schools are somewhere in-between regarding the quality and extent of use of educational aids<sup>38</sup>.
5. The school climate in quite a number of schools is not compatible with recent trends in pre-school education. For example, the rate of using educational games is rather low in public schools, subsidized private schools, and schools with low tuition in remote areas away from Beirut<sup>39</sup>. As for the relation between the pre-school and the children’s families, especially in public and subsidized private schools, it is far from ideal<sup>40</sup>.
6. A KG unit was established in the MEHE in the seventies; however, the current structure of the Ministry of Education does not include a special unit or department for pre-school education, nor is there at present, in institutions of higher education, a specialization in educational administration specifically for pre-school education. In

general, pre-schools are usually administered by principals of schools that have a pre-school component or KG teachers, the majority of whom are non-specialists.

- 2/1 ➤ The Pre-school education shows many weaknesses as evidenced in: 1) the lack of coherence in its curricula; 2) problems in the implementation of the curricula; 3) the low percentage of holders of appropriate degrees for teaching in this cycle; 4) inadequate school buildings and educational aids in most cases; 5) the school climate's lack of alignment with modern trends of pre-school education; and 6) the inadequacy of both the school administration and the central administration. These weaknesses are more acute in public and free private kindergartens.**

## **B. General Education**

7. The last process of curriculum development in Lebanon was an unprecedented one in the history of Lebanon in terms of its methodology and its comprehensive coverage of all cycles and all subject matter areas. However, it remained rather circumstantial, in the sense that it depended on certain circumstances that led to this huge operation and on certain individuals who led this effort. Thus, the development of curricula and school textbooks was not guided by authoritative reference guidelines and documents which are necessary for further revisions as well. The people involved in curriculum and textbook development have not been prepared for this purpose, and the process itself did not produce any stable dynamism for continuous follow-up and for evaluation of the curriculum.
8. Although participation of the educational community was much wider than previous times, this partnership was not comprehensive enough and did not involve all parties concerned (teachers, students, and parents).
9. Issuing the curricula in a detailed form through a ministerial decree reduced their flexibility and adaptability in light of the needs of schools and the new trends in education.
10. There is no system for monitoring the application of the curricula and for providing feedback for purposes of revision and enrichment. What the Office of Educational Counseling Services does focuses on visiting schools that have performed poorly on official examinations. Likewise, the General Educational Inspectorate focuses on monitoring the extent of abiding by the curricula or by administrative decisions among teachers.
11. The Ministry of Education has not benefited from studies that carried out extensive valuations of the new curricula<sup>41</sup>, nor did it benefit from reform efforts sponsored by international organizations. For example, CERD, in cooperation with UNICEF, has designed, during the years 1999 and 2000<sup>42</sup>, an integrated curriculum. School textbooks were prepared, teachers were trained in how to apply this curriculum, and the curriculum was piloted. An evaluation of this project was conducted, and relevant recommendations were made<sup>43</sup>. However, up to 2006, there are no indications of adopting, revising, or abandoning this curriculum.

- 2/2 ➤ The latest curriculum development endeavor failed to create an ongoing dynamism for curriculum development. This endeavor showed the following weaknesses: 1) ineffective partnership among all groups benefiting from the curricula; 2) issuance of detailed curricula by ministerial decrees which reflected itself in the limited**

**flexibility of the curricula to accommodate the needs of schools and to respond to emerging educational trends; 3) the lack of reference documents that offer guidelines for the development of the curriculum components; and 4) not benefiting from evaluation studies and experiments that were conducted.**

12. In comparison to previous curricula, the educational curricula issued in 1997 represented a significant qualitative change, especially in: 1) their development on the basis of objectives; 2) introduction of new subject matter areas; 3) updating knowledge base; and 4) the adoption of active methodologies. However, studies<sup>44</sup> carried out on the curricula showed many weaknesses in quality, as in 1) Internal inconsistency in the curricula where the different subject matter areas differed in the manner in which they were organized, in the way general and specific objectives were formulated, and in the organization of tables of content sequence; 2) the low degree of alignment between general curriculum goals, on the one hand, and general and specific objectives of subject matter areas as well as the content, on the other; 3) weakness in developing a scope and sequence that fits the subject matter, the time allowed, and the learning process; 4) problems with the appropriateness and validity of content; and 5) problems in formulation related to accuracy in using technical terms and in translation which resulted in discrepancies among the Arabic, English, and French versions of the curricula.
13. The evaluation of the curricula of different subject matter areas showed that some of these areas have serious problems in their design (Arabic, History, Geography, Philosophy and Civilizations, Music, and Physical Education); other areas have partial problems (English as a First Foreign language, Mathematics, Physics, Biology, Chemistry, Civic Education, Informatics, Technology, Fine Arts, and Theater); the rest of the areas have secondary problems only<sup>45</sup>.
14. There are weaknesses as well in the objectives and contents of the curricula in that the content of some subject matter areas is too wide to be covered in the time allotted to the subject, especially since the actual school year consists of 36 weeks.
15. Allowing for mathematics and sciences to be taught in a foreign language in intermediate and secondary cycles was inherited from the old curricula, however the new curricula extended that to the elementary cycle. The use of a foreign language as a language of instruction in mathematics and sciences poses problems which negatively affects learning in those two subjects<sup>46</sup>.
16. A new system of evaluation has been introduced. But this system has been plagued in its design and application by many problems: 1) an evaluation system based on competencies was adopted four years after implementation of the curricula that were based on objectives; 2) there are loopholes in the new system related to the foundations, principles, and tools of evaluation; 3) the teacher training done along with the introduction of the new system was not adequate, thus turning the evaluation process into a numerical operation instead of using it to evaluate students' performance and to improve the educational process; and 4) The educational facilities and resources needed for the implementation of the new system were not made available<sup>47</sup>. All these problems led to a sense of confusion among teachers.

**2/3 ➤ There is an inherent weakness in the current curricula manifested in the lack of alignment among general goals, special objectives and cycle objectives; in the limited scope and heavy content; in the lack of concordance between curriculum objectives and assessment system; and problems related to teaching mathematics and sciences in a foreign language.**

17. The initiative to develop school textbooks for all educational cycles has contributed to making the national textbook available to all and was an advanced move. However, the weak coordination<sup>48</sup> has brought about negative results, as in: 1) the heavy content is emphasized at the expense of skills, attitudes, and evaluation; 2) the discrepancy in quality among textbooks for different classes and subjects, where the lowest quality has been observed in the area of languages, especially Arabic; and 3) the presence of gender stereotyping and the presence of social-professional stereotypes especially in Arabic textbooks.
18. Experience has shown that the decision of CERD to take charge of preparing, printing, and distributing school textbooks has helped ensure that the national textbook is reaching everyone. The experience also proved problematic in the following ; 1) The absence of an independent authority in charge of developing criteria for textbook development and evaluation as well as monitoring the processes of development and evaluation and 2) the inflexibility of the textbook, the difficulty of implementing revisions, and the frequent reprints.

**2/4 ➤ Although the bold step taken to develop school textbooks for all educational cycles has contributed to making the national textbook available to all, the quality of these textbooks suffers from: 1) absence of a single independent authority for developing and monitoring textbooks in accordance with pre-determined criteria, and 2) the stagnation of the school textbooks.**

19. The academic conditions for appointing secondary school teachers have been loosened, which had a negative effect on the quality of education. Before 1979, teachers in public secondary schools used to be appointed on the basis of a 5-year university degree in secondary education (called *certificat d'aptitude professionnelle à l'enseignement secondaire*). There is agreement among educators that the graduates of the Faculty of Education at the Lebanese University at the time constituted a major factor in the revival of secondary education in Lebanon. In 1979, a new system of a 6-year university degree in secondary education was established. In 1996, the Ministry of Education decided to appoint as secondary teachers some of those who had been on contract after having them go through a one-year "training session" and not on the basis of the degree in secondary education. It is worth noting that appointing teachers by contract is done on discretionary basis. Up to now, about 4000 secondary teachers have joined the profession in this fashion.
20. A similar loosening of conditions for appointing teachers has also taken place in the pre-school, elementary, and intermediate cycles. Up to 1985, elementary teachers appointed had to be graduates of the Teachers' Colleges. In accordance with decree # 2636, dated 22 August 1985, about 4500 teachers were appointed from among those on contract, after having them go through training sessions. Since then, a new practice for appointing teachers on contract basis was put into place. This occurred in parallel with graduating teachers from Teachers Institutes whereby 3675 teachers graduated between the years 1994 and 2002<sup>49</sup>. Then came the Law # 442, issued 29 July 2002, which made it possible for university degree holders to be appointed as elementary school teachers in Lebanon. However, the law was not clear about whether the university degree includes educational preparation. Since then teachers with a university degree were contracted on a discretionary basis.
21. The policies and procedures followed during the last few decades resulted in lowering the standards of the teaching staff in many schools. Thus, the number of those on contract in public schools increased, from 6000 in 1993-1994, to 11000 in 2004-2005, i.e. from



21% to 27% of the total teaching body. Meanwhile, the number of non-degree holders on tenure appointment reached over 9000 elementary and secondary teachers (about one-third of all those on tenure). It is worth noting that those who have only a secondary certificate or less constitute 33% of teachers in public schools, 82% in subsidized private schools, and 50% in private schools<sup>50</sup>.

22. The expansion of teacher appointment on a discretionary basis in public schools was accompanied by a decrease in the actual teaching load of teachers in order to give teaching loads to those appointed by contract. This has led to two related phenomena: reduced work of teachers in school and the tendency to take overtime jobs and spend more time outside the school. Not following attendance regulations and not being fulltime at school has resulted in loose applications of evaluation and accountability procedures regarding teachers.
23. At present, there are no frameworks adopted for raising the competence level of the teaching staff in schools. After the new curricula were issued, the Ministry of Education and Higher Learning conducted extensive teacher training workshops for all public and some private school teachers. But this training was held only once and was specifically for the purpose of familiarizing teachers with the new curricula. The LAES evaluation study of the training showed that there were many problems related to planning, organization, instructional materials, trainers' qualifications, training styles, evaluation, and the choice and distribution of the trainees<sup>51</sup>. In 2000, a project for the continuous training of teachers and principals<sup>52</sup> was prepared with the following objectives:
  - a) Preparing a group of trainers (resource persons) to undertake the continuous training of teachers.
  - b) Supporting the six main teacher colleges in districts and gradually all local teacher colleges to become centers for continuous training as well as learning resource centers
  - c) Establishing an information and skills network based on new technologies, specially the internet.
  - d) Developing mechanisms for need assessment and for impact of training on classroom practices

The actual implementation of the project started in 2004-2005 in the six main teacher colleges in the mohafazat through regional plans prepared and supervised by the Preparation and Training Office at CERD<sup>53</sup>. The project aims at training 300 trainers and offering training modules to 20 000 teachers

24. There are no controls regarding the practice of the teaching profession in Lebanon except for requiring a 4-year university degree for teaching in public schools. The Equivalence committee at the MEHE is trusted with giving equivalences of university degrees to the license of Teaching. There are no MEHE professional controls regarding practicing teaching in private schools.

**2/5 ➤ Elementary education in public schools faces serious problems when it comes to the qualifications of its teachers as evidenced by: 1) the high percentage of teachers whose education has stopped at the Baccalaureate level or even before; 2) contracting teachers with university degree on a discretionary basis and without having any educational preparation; and 3) The lack of a system of professional development. Further more, secondary education faces other serious problems with teachers qualifications related to: 1) contracting of individuals to teaching positions on a discretionary basis and without having educational preparation; 2) appointment of full-time teachers on a discretionary basis and offering them a short**

**‘professional preparation’ session; and 3) There is a large scale project which started in 2004-2005 to offer continuous training for public elementary and secondary teachers.**

25. The problem of school buildings, in as far as sufficiency and the suitability of their locations are concerned, is a chronic one in public education. Quite a number of buildings housing schools are rented and do not meet the conditions required for school buildings, and one fifth of them require rehabilitation and renovation<sup>54</sup>. The “school map” is a project that was conceived a few decades ago, but it has not yet been put into effect. The project serves as a guidance system for choosing school locations in accordance with clear criteria based on the conceived objectives and role of education in Lebanon. The July 2006 war has added to the already existing problems after 40 schools were completely destroyed and 300 others were extensively damaged<sup>55</sup>. The resulting situation is bound to affect the quality of education in many regions in the foreseen future. However, it is important to know whether, in the long run, these acts of destruction will expedite the process of preparing an appropriate school map.
26. The material resources (laboratories, libraries, workshops, and computers)<sup>56</sup> in public schools in Lebanon are scarce. In cases where these resources are available in public schools, they are not used effectively in education for reasons relating to school administrations, lack of technicians, and lack of interest in what is not tested on official examinations.

**2/6 ➤ Public schools face the problem of inadequate buildings, facilities and educational provisions as it relates to their availability, suitability, quality, and use in teaching and learning.**

27. Few research studies and some data are available on instructional environment (classroom teaching) in public and private schools; the few that exist<sup>57</sup> point to traditional methods of instruction in mathematics and sciences and to the absence of the active student-centered methods of teaching suggested in the new curricula. The available data on school climate in Lebanon comes from the TIMSS 2003 which places Lebanon as the second from last among the 8 lowest countries on the list in the perceptions of teachers of how healthy the school climate (which includes relations between students, teachers, administration, and parents) is<sup>58</sup>.
28. The July 2006 war with Israel, along with all its repercussions has clearly pointed out great deficiencies in systems and human resources needed to look after students and teachers who suffered greatly during the war. The deficiencies lie in the lack of specialized cadre in the Ministry or specialists in guidance and counseling in schools as well as in the lack of well-rounded, qualified teachers who are able to understand student behavior, to identify psychological symptoms manifested by their students, and to refer these students to counselors. Many different programs were organized for this purpose, but they did not operate within a clear unified framework, and the effectiveness of these efforts was not assessed.

**2/7 ➤ The school environment in both public and private schools is characterized by the dominance of teacher-centered teaching approaches and an almost complete absence of active learning approaches. There are also some problems with the school climate as represented by the weak relations among students, teachers, administration, and parents.**

29. School administration in public schools manifests chronic weaknesses that might mostly be due to: 1) limited authority given to the principal; 2) the conditions for the appointment of a principal that are in operation; these conditions do not include any preparation (Diploma or BA) in educational leadership and administration); and, 3) some of these conditions are not being applied as is the case with the condition that principals should take and pass a course in educational administration offered at the Lebanese University before their appointment goes into effect (as stipulated in Law 320 dated 5/4/2001).
30. The Ministry of Education, through the Educational Development Project, launched in 2005 a program known as “Developing Leadership Among School Principals” for a two-year period to cover 30% of schools by 2007. A number of trainees will be groomed to become trainers for their colleagues. The project will specify the policies and general legislations that will govern the training of public school principals. Though this is stipulated in the project, until now, there has not been an institution for follow-up and continuous training of principals, and there has not been a system to follow up on the effect of training on administrative performance in schools.

**2/8 ➤ Public schools exhibit problems in their administration in at least four areas: 1) the limited authority given to the principal to lead and administer, 2) conditions and terms of appointment which do not require a university degree in educational administration, 3) a chronic lack of adherence to the minimum conditions specified in the laws that govern the appointment of principals, and 4) absence of a system of performance appraisal. To date, there is no institutionalization of preparing principals in leadership and educational administration and providing them with continuous professional development**

31. The evaluation study of students’ achievement in all subjects as measured by students’ performance on tests based on the competencies formulated by CERD, showed that there are inherent weaknesses in the competencies of basic subject matter areas, such as languages, mathematics, and sciences<sup>59</sup>. Furthermore, Lebanon participated in the TIMSS 2003 international study whose results showed that Lebanon ranked a weak 31 among 45 countries in mathematics and a weaker 41 in sciences<sup>60</sup>. Compared to the eight Arab Countries that participated in the study, Lebanon came first in mathematics and last in science.

**2/9 ➤ The learning outcomes in languages, mathematics, and science are low as measured by national standards; on the other hand, the outcomes of mathematics and science are low as measured by international standards.**

### **C. Vocational and Technical Education**

32. Vocational and technical education includes three levels: 1) vocational preparation for those who have finished the elementary cycle, 2) vocational and technical secondary education for those who have finished the intermediate cycle; this three-year level has two tracks: Technical Baccalaureate and Technical Secondary Diploma-Double System, 3) vocational and technical higher education which leads to one of four degrees: Technical Superior (TS)(3 years), Technical Degree (2 years after TS), and Technical Teaching Degree (5 years), and the Master degree.

33. The new vocational and technical education structure was issued in 2000 (Council of Ministers' decree 31 dated 16/8/2000) and was based on the new educational structure in Lebanon. Some of the main changes in this structure: 1) cancellation of the certificates and replacing with training to prepare skilled laborers, 2) including the TS, Technical Degree, and Technical Engineering Degree under higher education, 3) Making the TS a basic for continuing higher specialized degrees. However, no decrees were issued to translate the new structure into action and abide by its requirements and the old regulations some of which go back to the sixties remain in effect.
34. The new vocational and technical education curricula were issued in 2000. They were based on the system of competency teaching or performance skills that students are supposed to acquire. But these curricula have not been evaluated, and no monitoring or feedback mechanisms have been devised to help revise and develop these curricula continuously and thus constrained its development in line with technological development.
35. The most important reason for the low quality of vocational and technical education is that students are accepted into the technical baccalaureate or vocational secondary certificate-Double System classes without having to have passed the Intermediate Certificate (Brevet) or even without obtaining an acceptable grade average. This situation is one reason for the low achievement level of students in all tracks of vocational and technical education.
36. As for the public education secondary teachers, about one third of them are on contract by the hour and the tenured teachers among them are holders of the Technical Teaching Degree. The majority of teachers, on the other hand, are holders of university degrees, engineering degrees, or the TS. It is worth noting that vocational and technical education lacks a system for continuous training of teachers and this makes the teachers knowledge outdated because it copes with neither the new technological developments nor the new teaching methodology.
37. The administration of technical schools and institutes are highly centralized. School directors have little authority in academic and technical matters. Also the conditions for appointing school directors in technical education are the same as those in general education and do not take in consideration the special nature of technical education and its needs. It is to be noted that a large number of school and institute directors are secondary school teachers.
38. As for technical equipment and educational resources, they are not available in most cases. If available, such equipment is neither in sufficient numbers nor they fully support the needs of the curriculum. Moreover the equipment did not keep in pace with developments in production technology.
39. The teaching methods in vocational education are mainly theoretical and rote in nature and not based on recent educational methodology trends. Furthermore, evaluation techniques, whether at the school level or at the level of official examinations, have not been developed to go along with the curriculum development carried out in the year 2000.
40. No comparative data are available on the quality of learning outcomes of the curricula developed in 2000 against national and international standards. However, there is an impression that there is a wide gap between the stated objectives and the actual performance. The reasons for the gap might be the extensive nature of the subject matter which could not be covered in the time allotted (supposedly 36 weeks, but in reality not more than 25 weeks), the lack of development of new teaching methods and techniques (which remain mostly theoretical and lecture-type), and assessment techniques that have not been developed to suit developments in the curricula.

41. One feature of vocational and technical education is its special relation with the labor market whether in terms of needs, skills, and competencies or in training of students. However, this relation is weak in Lebanon on all level of vocational and technical education with the exception of Technical Secondary Diploma-Double System. Moreover, there is no mechanism in place to allow the participation of economic and production sectors in vocational and technical education, which results in gaps between what the students learn and what they will face after graduation, and this is interpreted by employers as low quality in the education of students.
42. Vocational and technical education secondary students lack career guidance, a lack which leads students to enroll in a specialization he/she does not want or does not suit his/her qualifications or the needs of the labor market. This will affect the student's educational continuation and success.
43. There are no criteria to assess, internally or externally, the quality of the vocational and technical education or follow-up studies in order to collect data and feedback to improve the teaching and/or administration in vocational and technical education. There is also laxity in important matters such as attendance of students, excessive vacations, and lack of control of teachers' performance, late beginning and early conclusion of the academic year. All of these lead to lowering standards of students and consequently lowering the passing grade.

**2/10 ➤ The 2000 vocational and technical education secondary curricula are, in general, of good quality. But there are several indications of the low quality of vocational and technical education, such as: 1) the low level of students admitted to vocational education; 2) the low level of academic and educational qualifications of the majority of teachers because of lack of in-service training to enable them to be in step with scientific and technical innovations; 3) the lack of needed facilities in school; 4) the lack of adoption and development of new teaching methods and evaluation techniques; 5) lack of communication between labor market since there is no mechanism to link employers and technical education institutions; 6) the absence of a career guidance system; and 7) the absence of quality criteria and feedback.**

#### **D. Higher Education**

44. Higher vocational and technical education is plagued by additional problems in quality as a consequence of its being run in a manner similar to that of secondary education rather than to that of higher education. Public institutes and colleges do not have any special characteristics that set them apart from secondary technical schools, whether in buildings and facilities, administration, faculty qualifications, or their internal operating systems. In the private sector, the same institution could be licensed to grant degrees at three educational levels: vocational, technical secondary, and higher (education). In other words, higher education in these areas takes place in the same context as the pre-university education; i.e. under the same administration, in the same facilities, and with the same faculty. Furthermore, there are no classifications or ranks for teachers, as is the case in university education, and there are no scientific departments in these institutes and colleges. The teachers in public institutes and colleges are employees of the General Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education. Moreover, the official examinations

for TS and degrees are centralized as is the case with the examinations that take place at the end of the secondary cycle.

**2/11 ➤ Higher technical education faces additional problems that affect its quality as evidenced by: 1) the absence of an authority or administration responsible for higher technical education; currently it follows secondary education and its directorate; 2) lack of distinction between higher technical education, on the one hand, and secondary technical education, on the other, with respect to the specifications of the institutions; 3) absence of a system of classification of teachers as is the case with university education; 4) centralization of official examinations; 5) adoption of an inflexible system based on the academic year and on a comprehensive official examination for granting degrees; and 6) ) exclusion of vocational and technical education as a higher education track.**

45. The available data on quality in non-technical higher education goes back to the academic year 1994-1995. These data indicates that the quality of higher education and that of the Lebanese university suffers from serious problems related to faculty, curriculum, and research, though there are differences among universities<sup>61</sup>. However what happened since then allows us to hypothesize that these serious problems are still there.
46. Regarding private higher education, the MEHE decreed in 1996 standards that should be met in order to certify new higher education institutions. However, the MEHE certified new institutions without applying the standards it decreed. Until today, no new private higher education law has been issued to replace that of 1961. In that law, for example, the president of the university may be a holder of a degree not higher than a bachelor degree. Also, in this law, there are no standards for buildings, equipments, and staff. Consequently, the conditions that today higher education institutions require for certification are those of law of 1961. Consequently, higher education institutions can operate under very low standards, at a time there are no modern standards and institutions for quality assurance in the MEHE. This picture applies to many higher education institutions, as indicated by the absence of research, the low standards for faculty appointment, the absence of faculty promotion rules based on academic performance, using apartment buildings to house such institutions, etc.
47. On the other hand there are few universities whose quality has been recognized as a result of meeting international, European, or American standards. Among those, some universities sought external evaluation to assess its quality, or accredited<sup>62</sup>.
48. Lately, the Lebanese University conducted a self-study of its work<sup>63</sup>. The self-study report points to several quality problems: weakness of reference documents that provide frame works for its work, weakness of data bases and the limited use of what is available, the submission of the university in its decisions to authorities and political influence, lack of professional development for its staff, scarcity of human and material resources, weakness in teaching and assessment practices. The report also presents clear recommendations regarding the needs of the university. However, nothing has happened until now to implement these recommendations. It is worth mentioning that many recommendations were made in the last decades to develop and reform the university by the league of full time professors<sup>64</sup>, or independent academic associations<sup>65</sup> and international organizations<sup>66</sup>.

**2/12 ➤ Higher education in Lebanon suffers from serious quality problems which emanate from archaic standards in private higher education and from failure to abide by what was issued later, and the absence of**

**structures needed to control quality in private higher education, the absence of national frameworks and structures for quality assurance. In the Lebanese University, quality-related problems are attributed to not adopting a reform project for it, not availing the needed resources, and losing its autonomy in the last decades.**

---

---

**6. Education oriented towards the development of knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for handling information and the intensive use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT).**

---

---

49. The general education curricula issued in 1997 did not include any objectives for Information Technology and Communication (ICT); however, they did include one specific objective for technology education in general, namely, the formation of a citizen “who is aware of the importance of technology and capable of using, developing, and interacting with it in a conscious accurate manner.” Aside from Informatics, the cycle objectives and the specific objectives for subject matter areas have mentioned, only in passing, the use of IT in education.
50. The introduction of Informatics as a subject matter in schools was one of the innovations introduced by the 1997 curricula. Although the stated curriculum objectives have been rather ambitious and included building knowledge, attitudes, and skills for dealing with information and using it in learning, the curriculum content is limited in many aspects: 1) The curriculum is limited to information skills and does not stress the use of IT and communication in teaching other subject matter areas or in autonomous learning; 2) The current curriculum covers only grades 7-12 at the rate of one class period every week; and 3) Informatics as a subject matter is not assigned any weight in school evaluation or in official examinations. It is for this reason that the Informatics curricula are not taught in many private and most public schools.
51. One of the obstacles facing the contribution of education to building an information society is the delay and slow pace of equipping public schools with computer laboratories and internet access. In 2003, the Ministry of education launched a project with the purpose of equipping 250 intermediate and secondary schools with computer labs. Information collected from schools show that 56% of public schools possessed one or more computers<sup>67</sup> while private schools had computer labs or individual computers for use in education and administration. There are no accurate statistics concerning the extent of internet access at public and private schools.
52. Another obstacle is the lack of qualified Informatics teachers in public schools. Lately, the Ministry of Education launched many experimental projects in this respect, such as the “Manara” project that included 17 public schools, the “Partners in Lebanon” project which involved 200 teachers, and the MOS project that involved 75 teachers a year over a period of five years. However, these projects remain limited in their scope and do not follow a comprehensive plan, the lack of which renders such projects un-synchronized in their goals and mechanisms.
53. Even if equipment is made available, the greatest obstacle will be how to use the ICT in teaching in such a way as to make technology an effective tool that aids students in learning, both in school and at home, and not just in locating information but also in answering questions, choosing relevant information, and constructing knowledge through individual and group efforts.

2/13 ➤ **The contribution of general education in Lebanon to building an information society remains limited as evidenced by: 1) the current Informatics curriculum covers only the development of basic skills. Informatics education, in its curriculum and applications, does not aim to develop knowledge, attitudes, and skills needed for handling information or for using information and communication technology in acquiring knowledge in various subject matter areas and domains; 2) the curriculum is not followed in many schools in general, and in most public schools in particular; 3) the basic skills in informatics are not tested at school or in official examinations; and 4) teacher preparation in knowledge and skills pertaining to the use of information technology in teaching and learning remains a very slow process.**

---

---

**7. Education that develops the general education of individuals and provides them with critical thinking skills and moral reasoning, enabling them to live and work in a modern, changing society and to become lifelong learners.**

---

---

54. The fast pace of cultural, economic, and political change in modern societies calls for skills, attitudes, and beliefs that would help an individual to accept change and actively adapt to and interact with it. What helps the individual most in this respect is his/her ability to remain a lifelong learner. Does education in Lebanon contribute to preparing individuals who are able to live and work in a changing modern society and to continue to learn throughout their life? Academic concerns and matters dominate education in Lebanon and normally do not deal with social and environmental problems and with contemporary changes in the modern society.
55. The 1997 general education curricula did not list under its general goals any goal for development of critical thinking and moral reasoning<sup>68</sup>, though it mentioned moral commitment, to prepare students to adapt to change and to the demands of living and working in changing modern societies. However, the general goals of some subjects noted the need to develop some general thinking abilities, such as problem-solving in mathematics. It is worth noting that the curricula did not explicitly mention moral reasoning though it referred to “moral commitment.” The curriculum evaluation of the new curricula showed that the general thinking skills, if referred to in the curricula, have not been reflected in the goals of different subjects, textbooks, and teaching practices<sup>69</sup>. In general, education in Lebanon does not help students acquire the skills (critical thinking abilities and moral reasoning), attitudes (accepting others), and beliefs (learning does not end with formal education) that develop their ability to live and work in a changing society and to become lifelong learners.

2/14 ➤ **The curricula, teaching methods, and accompanying activities do not aim, in one subject matter area or across subject matter areas, to develop critical thinking and moral reasoning and related attitudes enough to enable individuals to live and work in a changing modern society and to turn into lifelong learners.**



56. There are deficiencies in the general education targeted by the curricula as indicated in the small share allotted to arts (music, drawing, theater, acting), and this is accompanied with marginalization of arts in instruction or assessment. Consequently, arts are totally neglected as indicated by the small share of arts in extra-curricular activities (art clubs and activities) and the lack of human and material resources.

**2/15 ➤ There is a deficiency in the curricula with regard to general education, as indicated by the insufficiency of arts (music, drawing, theater, acting) in curricula and of related co-curricular activities (art clubs and activities).**

## Part III: Education that Contributes to Social Integration

---

---

### 8. Education that develops citizenship in its three dimensions: National identity, civic participation, and human partnership.

---

---

#### A. National Identity

1. The new 1997 curricula have adopted points (a) and (b) of the preamble to the Lebanese Constitution regarding national identity (General Principles for the Curriculum) and derived from it general objectives such as shaping a citizen who is a) proud of his/her country Lebanon and of his/her belonging to it, and committed to its causes, and b) proud of his/her Arab identity and of his/her belonging to the Arab world, and committed to both. The issue of national identity is present in the general objectives of five subject matters; namely, History, Civic Education, Arabic, Geography, and Physical Education (P.E). It is not clear why national identity has been restricted to those five subjects and not included in the others. According to studies done, this is probably due to lack of alignment and harmony among the general goals of the curricula and the general as well as specific goals of subject matter areas in all cycles; between the objectives and the content; and between the curriculum and the textbooks<sup>70</sup>. Such disharmony would later reflect on what the textbook says, what the teacher says, and what the students say. This disharmony is paralleled by discrepancies among schools regarding the national socialization.
2. On another level, it is observed that the curricula exhibit a weakness in synthesizing "national identity" with other related terms such as cultural openness and diversity for example. While "cultural openness" is mentioned in the general objectives of foreign languages, "national identity" appears in the general objectives of Arabic. Similarly, the concept of "living together" appears along the concept of national identity, in one of the general objectives of Arabic and then disappears from the special objectives of Arabic, and from the general and special objectives of all other subjects.
3. Thirdly, the Ministry of Education and Higher Learning was not able to design a curriculum for History, or to develop textbooks for it, nine years after the issuing of the new curricula, whose general objectives stipulate the shaping of a citizen "who is aware of his/her collective national history, away from narrow partisanship, and towards building a united society that is open to other cultures" (General Objectives, article 2-2, item D). The history curricula were issued in 2000 (Decree number 3175) and textbooks were written accordingly, however, the curricula and textbooks were stopped from implementation. No alternative curricula or textbooks have been issued until now and students are still studying in history textbooks based on 1968 curricula for the secondary cycle and on 1970 curricula for elementary and intermediate cycles. Studies have shown a divergence in the political culture of the Lebanese with respect to ancestors (the good and the bad)<sup>71</sup>, and to geopolitics (friends and enemies). This divergence is directly mirrored in schools through their respective social milieu. Studies have shown also that the textbooks of geography, civic education, and sociology do not emphasize skills and attitudes<sup>72</sup>. Such a situation leads to duplicity in the official discourse, transmitted through the official textbooks and reproduced by students in examinations, and the unofficial (actual) discourse of teachers and students and to differences among schools in education for a national identity.

- 3/1 ➤ The role of the school in building of national belongingness exhibits weaknesses in at least four forms: 1) the dispersion of the concept of national identity throughout curricula, textbooks, and educational practices; 2) using memorization as the only learning strategy; and 3) the weak connection between national identity and other related terminology such as cultural openness, diversity, confessional identities, and common living (living together), 4) lack of minimal agreement on historical and geographical as well as political dimensions of identity.
- 3/2 ➤ There is duplicity in the official discourse taught and the discourse derived from the social circles of teachers and students. There are also differences among private schools in their understanding of what the concept of "national identity" stands for.

## B. Civic Participation

4. Lebanon is a civic state; it is neither secular nor religious. The relationship among its individuals and groups is governed by the constitution and the law, except for personal affairs<sup>73</sup>. From this perspective, the civic aspect of citizenship upbringing deals with at least three issues: 1) the political regime in Lebanon as established by the constitution, the related laws (the election law among others) and the related concepts (democracy, liberty, and political involvement); 2) the culture of law and related concepts (equity, merit, the power of the law, individual rights and obligations etc.); and 3) justice and related concepts (regional balanced development, group rights, etc.).
5. The "general principles" of the curricula refer to two of the above-mentioned points in the articles that deal with a) the rule of law, b) respect of individual and group freedoms as guaranteed by the Constitution, and c) participation in social and political activities (preamble to the curricula, the "on the social level" section). However, "the general objectives of the curricula" do not mention any of these points. For instance, the term "democracy" is not found under the general or the special objectives or scope and sequence of Civic Education. If we compared among the general objectives, the specific objectives, and the content, we would find that certain topics that appear in one level tend to disappear in another. All these examples point to the lack of alignment in the pedagogy of civic education.
6. Secondly<sup>74</sup>, the analysis of textbooks showed that they are based on rote learning and values and knowledge but not practicing skills. Thus, students do not participate in activities related to the culture of law (condemning corruption or condemning fanaticism, discrimination, partiality, etc...) or in preparatory activities necessary for future political participation (election of class representatives). Even though some lessons require students to carry out civic activities (with municipalities, the police, the judiciary, etc...) the MEHE has forbidden students in the public sector to leave their schools.
7. Thirdly, the educational system in Lebanon places more weight on the duties and obligations of the students than on their rights. Moreover, the rules and regulations do not include anything about the rights of, nor about catering for, students with special needs. Nor do schools guarantee and practice such rights as the right of students to comfort and proper entertainment. Furthermore, although corporal punishment is prohibited, students' rights are often violated. Finally, Civic Education as a school subject does not deal with developing moral reasoning in particular and moral education in general.
8. Finally, the measurement of student achievement of the competencies set for Civic Education shows that the mean scores of students in the subject were high compared to their other subjects - which ranged between average and below average. Moreover, no

differences were found between the achievement of students who followed the old curriculum and the achievement of those who followed the new curriculum. This indicates that the curriculum for this subject matter is so weak that all the knowledge is acquired from public life and the media, and not from schools<sup>75</sup>.

**3/3 ➤ The role of the school in civic education is rather weak; this weakness is reflected in different forms such as 1) inadequate elaboration of the concept of civic responsibility in the curricula; 2) the dispersion of the elements of civic education in the curriculum over its various components; and 3) weakness in the skills, application, and moral aspects. All this leads to inadequate acquisition of civic education concepts and applications.**

### **C. Human Partnership**

9. One study showed that The Civic Education curriculum from grade 1 till the end of secondary cycle<sup>76</sup> is saturated with the items of the Human Rights Declaration. However, this curriculum does not sufficiently deal with the Declaration of Child Rights of 1959 and Article 29 of the Children's Rights Convention. The general goals of curricula do not often include reference to international conventions to help spread these basic concepts in the various subject areas (other than civic education).
10. Moreover, curricula do not adequately cover global concerns and challenges such as natural disasters, pollution problems, and issues related to pollution, poverty and diseases.
11. The efforts of the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD) in collaboration with the UNICEF, in terms of providing adequate training for teachers in order to familiarize them with the concepts of human and children's rights and with the Charter of the Rights of the Child, as part of the Global Education Project, are indeed notable, yet such efforts remain rather meager and scattered.

**3/4 ➤ The role of education in the development of human partnership falls short of expectations in that the curricula do not adequately cover either the values called for in international declarations and treaties nor the global environmental and humanitarian issues.**

---

---

**9. Education that contributes to social cohesion and provides learners with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed for living together in a diverse society.**

---

---

12. Lebanon has witnessed two civil wars since its independence in 1943; a short one (1958), and a long one (1975-1990). Recently, Lebanon has managed to escape the threat of internal divisions and conflicts during the 2006 war through a remarkable show of unity among the Lebanese. Regardless of external factors and regional conflicts that might affect the Lebanese situation, Lebanese society suffers from internal conflicts that make it vulnerable to being influenced by and divided over external interference. A heavy price is to be paid every time. It is not the duty of education to create social cohesion; this is the duty of the various political currents and forces. Still, education can cement social cohesion among the new generations in a way that makes them more immune to rapid division. Establishing social cohesion in younger generations could be achieved through social mix, opportunities for interaction, and through providing students with the knowledge, values, and skills necessary for "living together".

## A. Spaces for Social Mix

13. One study<sup>77</sup> has shown that student composition of universities in Lebanon is usually characterized by the sectarian homogeneity. Excluding the Lebanese University (LU) branches in distant regions, where geographic population distribution explains the sectarian composition; the real problem lies in universities located in Beirut and Mount Lebanon. In these two confessionally diverse regions which receive students from other geographical regions, only one institution reflects this diversity and provides room for social mix. The other private universities are characterized by sectarian homogeneity. The highest percentage of sectarian homogeneity (more than 90%) is detected in the "First Branch" (Muslims) and the "Second Branch" (Christians) of LU. Sectarian homogeneity among students goes hand in hand with sectarian homogeneity among members of the administration and faculty.
14. Secondly, on the level of faculty representation, except for the Union of Full-Time Professors which brings under its banner professors from all branches and faculties of LU, there exists no union of professors in private universities, or a union of professors in private and public universities. Student unions do not exist either; the National Association for the Students of the LU was never revived after the 1975-1990 war; each branch has its own independent student union. However, at the level of pre-university education, plenty of opportunities for mixing at the level of faculty representation are available through the Union of Secondary School Teachers in Public Education, the Association of Elementary School Teachers in Public Education, the Association of Vocational Education Teachers, and the Syndicate of Private School Teachers. All these organizations come together under "the Teachers' Bureau" which leads common action (strikes, demonstrations, sit-ins, etc...) among the various sectors of the teaching body.
15. Thirdly, the small number of professional teacher associations is noticeable. There are two such associations only: one for French teachers and the other for English Language teachers (ATEL). There is also the Association of Private School Owners. On the other hand, most schools tend to be part of separate one-color associations that lack diversity and are known as bureaus, general secretariats, or directorates according to the association they belong to.

**3/5 ➤ The spaces for social mix in education in Lebanon have shrunk considerably during the last few years at the levels of university student composition, university teachers associations, student unions, youth organizations, and the professional organization of teachers and educators. This problem is most acute in the Lebanese University and in public education in general.**

## B. Opportunities for Interaction

16. Opportunities for interaction among educational institutions are very limited. The interaction is confined to private and public schools participating in the UNESCO program, in addition to bilateral cooperation between some schools and to occasional meetings of some independent private schools. But the bulk of organized interaction takes place within the one-color educational institutions which belong to one group.
17. Secondly, there is no published information about extracurricular activities conducted by some schools for the purpose of interaction between their students and students of other institutions within frameworks of common interests or around topics of general interest to all participants. These activities that include health, civic, scout and sport activities are organized by schools to enable students with common interests and concerns to interact with one another. But the lack of availability of information about extracurricular

activities may be evidence of the absence of such activities. At any rate, public schools which rarely allow any violation of the pre-determined school schedule; thus, they don't allow students to participate in internal (within the same school) or external (with other schools) activities that offer opportunities for interaction. It is probable that some important initiatives in this direction are already taking place, but they remain rather limited.

18. Thirdly, there are initiatives taken by outside parties and nongovernmental organizations (NGO's) that take the form of special programs for training teachers in specific areas (peace education and conflict resolution, education for democracy, and the culture of law). Participating teachers in these programs come from different private and public schools, and, thus, these teachers are given the opportunity to interact with one another. Moreover, periodic educational conferences are organized by the Association of Secondary School Teachers and by educational institutions and universities; these conferences are attended by a varied numbers of teachers. Very often, interaction at these conferences is limited to the educators and teachers of the institution organizing the event.

**3/6 ➤ Education in Lebanon provides limited opportunities for interaction among its institutions, students, and teachers. Thus, participative programs between schools are scarce and usually involve same-color schools. Extracurricular activities, especially in public schools, are also scarce, whether within the same school or in conjunction with other schools. Finally, professional activities that promote interaction among teachers are rather limited.**

### **C. Education, Values and Skills for Living in a Diverse Society**

19. The new curricula encouraged cooperative team and field work to broaden the educational horizons of students and to help them acquire the competencies of listening/attention to what others say, discussion, acceptance of different opinions, and expansion of horizons of knowledge. Cooperative teamwork was applied in schools with means that allow for that and whose teachers were trained to use this approach. But the lack of such needed facilities and capabilities at most schools has rendered textbook subject matter about Self and Other, about cooperative teamwork, and about dialogue material for mere memorization.

**3/7 ➤ Education in Lebanon offers limited opportunities for the acquisition of knowledge and values needed for "living together" because such opportunities are not accompanied by classroom and school practices and activities that turn them into skills and behaviors.**

---

---

**10. Education that contributes to social mobility: horizontally, among geographical locations, and vertically, among social strata.**

---

---

20. The degree of horizontal social mobility among geographical locations and vertical social mobility among social classes is a reflection of the degree of the coherence in social space in a certain country. It also shows the opportunities offered to individuals to move back and forth in this space. Furthermore, it is an expression of the degree of the feeling that the scope of mobility within the society as a whole is unhindered and without any visible or non-visible, official or nonofficial, restrictions that might relate to color, gender, religion, sect, or place of birth. The question here is whether education in Lebanon

contributes to this social mobility or hinders it. Very often, it is higher education that is expected to provide the chances for social mobility. This is due to the fact that elementary schools (and institutions of basic education in general) are usually closely related to the local community. Secondary education, on the other hand, lies between these two extremes (basic education, on the one hand, and higher education, on the other), a position that makes it difficult to assess its effect on social mobility. Therefore, in this document, the diagnosis of social mobility is restricted to higher education.

### **A. Horizontal Social Mobility**

21. Data shows<sup>78</sup> that where geographical mobility in higher education in Lebanon exists, it tends to be from the distant regions (periphery) to the Greater Beirut area (center) and not in the opposite direction. It follows that the branches of the Lebanese University in the North, South and Bekaa are the most geographically homogenous higher education institutions because more than 80% of their enrolled students belong, according to their identity cards (their place of birth), to the same region in which the branch is located. This shows that the presence of higher education institutions in the distant locations is a mere geographical fact and does not hold any added value in terms of specializations or academic characteristics that might attract students from other regions, which demonstrates the limits of “regionally balanced development” in higher education. There is one private university located in the North and its students come not just from that region but from Mount Lebanon as well. On the other hand, the majority of students at universities in Beirut and Mount Lebanon come from these two regions except for the American University of Beirut (whose students are from different regions) and the Lebanese University–First branches (West Beirut) (whose students are from the South, Southern part of Mount Lebanon and Beirut).
22. Regarding the movement from the university to the job market, a study<sup>79</sup> shows that there is a tendency towards segmentation in study/job market. In other words, there are almost-closed institutions that offer pre-university education, university education and job opportunities. About half of the university students tend to find work within the same region in which they had studied whereas the other half tend to find work in a region different from the one they were born in. The exception to this rule are university students in Beirut and Mount Lebanon who tend to work within their regions, keeping in mind that professional geographic mobility from other regions tends to go in the direction of these two regions. On the other hand, the tendency of movement for career purposes from one region to the other (other than towards Beirut and Mount Lebanon) is almost null (0-1%). In addition, the tendency to leave the country to work outside (mainly in the Gulf) surpasses, in importance, the tendency for geographical career mobility within Lebanon.

**3/8 ➤ The contribution of higher education to geographical mobility is limited, as the general tendency is either for settlement of students within the same region or their mobility from remote regions to specific universities in the Greater Beirut area. Expectations regarding the chances for finding work after graduation confirm these two trends; however, the tendency to seek work outside Lebanon remains greater than the tendency to work in other regions of Lebanon.**

### **B. Vertical Social Mobility**

23. A study has shown<sup>80</sup> that higher education contributes to an increasing social mobility for about 44% of its attendees irrespective of where they start and where they reach on the

social scale. A striking result of this study reveals that the contribution of the Lebanese University to social mobility is less than that of private universities even though the former is almost free of charge while the latter charge high tuition fees. This conclusion may be explained by a host of converging factors that relate to the quality of education, the number and type of specializations, and opportunities for financial support. A low quality education diminishes the chances of mobility. Moreover, specializations in Humanities (such as literature, social and political sciences, education and mass communication, etc...) don't contribute to mobility in the same way that specializations such as engineering, medicine, and law do. However, good quality education doesn't help in mobility if the financial cost constitutes an obstacle to enrollment (especially in private colleges). A study has revealed<sup>81</sup> that financial aid offered by universities such as the American University of Beirut or by other granting agencies such as the Hariri Foundation has had great positive impact on mobility in Lebanon.

24. A study has shown<sup>82</sup> that mobility between various types of pre-university education and various types of higher education is highly limited. Thus, the highest concentration of graduates of private schools will be in private universities whereas graduates of public schools will join the Lebanese University (open colleges) and Beirut Arab University. The study also showed that the more affluent among university-bound students join the American University of Beirut and the Lebanese American University, middle class students head for other private universities, and low-income students join the Lebanese University. Students at the Lebanese University branches in the North (Third Branch), the South (Fourth Branch), and Bekaa (Fifth Branch) are at the bottom of the social ladder, compared to students at other LU branches or at other universities<sup>83</sup>.

**3/9 ➤ The contribution of higher education to vertical social mobility is limited especially at the Lebanese University. Among the impediments of such mobility are the low quality of education, the existence of specializations that have narrow career options, and the scarcity of financial aid and other forms of students support. This mobility is also hindered by the weak academic mobility between different types of secondary education and different types of higher education.**

---

**11. Education that contributes to the social inclusion of dropouts and individuals marginalized inside the school as well as to the prevention of social marginalization.**

---

25. The phenomenon of marginalization is an aspect of all schools, though in varying degrees. All students of different ages, socioeconomic backgrounds, religious affiliations, and in all geographical locations are exposed to this phenomenon. Marginalization is manifested as aggressive or discriminatory practices towards some students, and it could be manifested explicitly or implicitly. These marginalization practices could result from various causes whose nature might be educational (related to students' achievement), socio-educational, physical, or psychological, and they might come from either fellow students or from the teachers themselves. As a result, the marginalized students will be vulnerable to failing, dropping out, or being delayed in their studies; they might also suffer relative disaffection and detachment from school social life. However, the size of this phenomenon, its mechanisms, and the way to interact and deal with it cannot be determined properly because of the lack of authoritative studies on it<sup>84</sup>.



26. There are sporadic efforts made by nongovernmental organizations and ministries to offer opportunities for dropouts to reintegrate in the regular educational track, or to offer them some form of vocational training to help them acquire skills needed for a certain vocation. However, the curricula aren't organized in a way that would pre-empt the phenomena of dropout and social marginalization. The curricula are organized on the basis of fixed subject matter areas that don't offer choices that would address students' preferences and interests. Moreover, the curricula don't include career guidance programs; nor do they include having clubs and workshops that value non-theoretical activities. Finally, these curricula don't provide opportunities for field work to highlight the status of the socially marginalized students, don't include any procedures that allow for making projections about the possibilities of delinquency, and don't provide students-at-risk with moral reasoning skills that could help prevent delinquency.

**3/10 > Schools do not have adequate human resources or special programs for reducing marginalization inside the school. Furthermore, curricula are not organized in such a way that would provide students-at-risk with the knowledge, skills, and values that would protect them from dropping out from school, social marginalization, or involvement in violent activities, or delinquency.**

## Part IV: Education that Contributes to Economic Development

---

---

### 12. Education that contributes to the development of human capital.

---

---

1. The educational repertoire of the Lebanese people has remarkably increased during the past decades. The illiteracy rate decreased from 32% in the early seventies to 8% in the year 2006, and the percentage of people with secondary level education and beyond increased from 8% to 27.2%. The percentage of people with secondary level education and beyond has increased as well among the economically active participation from 10.6% to 36.1% in 2004 while the percentage of illiterate and semi-illiterate has decreased from 64.7% to 9.1%. In the same period the illiteracy rate among younger ages (10-14 years old) has decreased to 0.5% due to the continuous increase in the rate of school enrollment<sup>85</sup>.
2. An improvement of educational repertoire has taken place for the whole Lebanese society; however, there are still discrepancies among geographical locations and social classes. Discrepancies in the level of secondary education and beyond between sexes have decreased; indeed, there is a change in favor of females (13.7% for males versus 15.8% for females). But the illiteracy rate of females remained twice as much as that of males, probably due to the old inherited difference among sexes which is still witnessed clearly in older generations. It is worth noting that the percentage of male university graduates is equal to that of females in the total population; however, the percentage of university graduates among female workers is more than twice as much as the percentage of male university graduates among male workers (38% versus 16%). This is probably because females more than males seem to seek jobs that require a university degree. The discrepancies among geographical locations still exist; thus, illiteracy rate and the percentage of degree holders are still much higher in Beirut than they are in the Bekaa and the North. The discrepancies among social classes are extremely high, and yet still going higher. The percentage of families that suffer from low level of saturation of education increased from 23% in 1996 to 37.9% in 2004<sup>86</sup>.

**4/1 ► The educational profile of the Lebanese people has in general witnessed continuous improvement for both sexes. But the educational repertoire suffers some shortcomings in: 1) the presence of illiterates, especially among economically active people. In addition, the percentage of those who have secondary education and beyond still needs to be increased; 2) continued discrepancy between the center (Beirut) and the periphery; and 3) the increasing percentage of Lebanon families with low degree of saturation in education.**

3. The economic investment of the people's human capital is still limited, and that is evident in many ways. First, vocational and technical degree holders are less than general Baccalaureate or university degree holders. Second, the average of gross economic participation (which is the percentage of working force to the total number of population) decreased from 34% in 1997 to 31% in 2004. Third, the economic involvement of women, who surpass men at the level of secondary education and above,

is still low; it only increased from 9.5% women in 1970 to 12% 2004. Economic involvement of Lebanese women is less than it is in most countries around the world even though Lebanese women maintain a higher educational level than women in these other countries. Fourth, the number of Lebanese who are leaving the country has increased during the period 1996-2001 as compared to the 1975-1990 period<sup>87</sup>. It is worth noting that the general educational level of those leaving, as measured by literacy levels or by the Baccalaureate or the university degrees they hold, is higher than those who stay in Lebanon. Fifth, the unemployment rate increased from 8.5% in 1997 to 11.5% in 2001, including holders of higher education degrees<sup>88</sup>.

**4/2 ➤ The economic investment of the population's educational repertoire is below what is expected whether evidenced by: 1) the larger numbers of general education degrees compared to vocational degrees; 2) the low economic involvement, in general, and the involvement of educated women, in particular; 3) the high percentage of educated people who immigrate to other countries; and 4) the high rate of unemployment among the educated.**

---



---

**13. Education that provides quantitatively and qualitatively competent work force to meet the needs of the Lebanese market and that can compete in free job markets.**

---



---

**A. Education that provides for the Lebanese job market.**

4. The job market for university graduates suffers from a serious crisis which is represented by a plethora of graduates in the job market. The crisis is evidenced by: 1) the increasing percentage of unemployment among graduates; 2) the increasing rates of immigration; and 3) the spread of below-level employment which includes masked unemployment; and employment in jobs that require qualifications lower than those of the graduates. On the other hand, the available data do not show a shortage in the graduates as evidenced by high salaries being paid for certain specializations, hiring of highly educated foreign workers, or the existence of requests by employment institutions for graduates with qualifications not offered by higher education institutions.
5. One of the factors that account for excess (and unemployment) is the fact that the outside job market, especially the job market in the Arab countries which used to absorb the excess of graduates, is now satisfying its needs by employing graduates of their own universities or by employing people from other countries who accept lower wages. Another factor is the local market saturation. This saturation, however, hides two problems. The first problem is evidenced by the inability of the Lebanese economy to create new work opportunities. The second problem is evidenced by the laxity of professional standards in many of the production sectors. If we take the teaching profession as an example, we notice that the saturation of the local market reflects the deterioration of the professional standards and relates to lowering of wages and hiring people on non-professional and on personal grounds. But when professional standard levels are elevated, there will be a shortage in teachers as well as in translators, social, and clerical workers.
6. Secondly, among the factors that account for excess and unemployment is the situation of higher education in Lebanon. In the past three decades, Lebanon has witnessed an outburst in the number of higher education institutions and their branches which were

haphazardly established without any guidelines, rational planning, or governmental supervision. This situation created two complementary problems. The first problem is that students (especially females) are attending universities for social, rather than academic and career, considerations; the degree isn't looked at by them as a vital tool for improving their chances of economic participation and competitiveness; and they are looking for easy specializations that lead to joining professions that are easy to get (such as teaching). As a result, there is dominance of Humanities specializations in universities. The second problem is that current policies allow the establishment of new universities, specializations, and branches which have been motivated sometimes by political and commercial considerations at the expense of standards, educational quality, and professional preparation (curricula, faculty qualifications, research, buildings, facilities, and student services)<sup>89</sup>.

7. Thirdly, among the factors that account for excess and unemployment is the weak coordination among concerned sides in this respect. There is no concrete coordination between the vocational and technical education and higher education and between these and those concerned with economic and employment policies, and with ministries concerned with industrial, agricultural, and service sectors. It is difficult for the implementation of an educational strategy to make a difference in meeting labor market needs if this strategy is not coupled with economic, employment, and development of human resources strategies.
8. Higher education in Lebanon witnessed changes in programs and in services offered for students through the creation of new programs related to new professions, the construction of corridors between academic education and professional training, and the establishment of new services to be offered to students. However, these changes appeared in a disproportionate way and were offered unequally by universities. In general, many new programs (alternate education, continuous education, distance education, and virtual education) have been created, but the construction of the corridors among them was weak. In addition, services such as guidance and counseling, support and compensation programs, information services and alumni affairs services also remain weak. The educational institutions do not have databases that include information about supply and demand of work force by degree, specialization, and career position.
9. The relation between educational institutions and employing institutions in Lebanon, except in few instances, remains weak. This fact is manifested in the absence of, or the scarcity, involvement of economic and professional institutions 1) in the management board or advisory bodies of higher educational institutions; 2) in decisions regarding the creation of new programs and new specializations, the development and revision of curricula; 3) in college life, except for a limited role represented by filling faculty vacancies; 4) in funding research done by higher education institutions, proposing joint research, and requesting some studies to be carried out; and 5) in organizing individual and collective meetings and exhibitions for acquaintance purposes or for following developments here and there, and offering work and training opportunities needed by both parties.
10. The bulk of flow to the labor market comes from general education due to school dropouts<sup>90</sup>. It is worth mentioning that the proportion of those who take fast technical training sessions (certificates) is high. These training certificates programs that were provided by the private sector have not been sufficiently studied and assessed for their quality, and their development has not been given any efforts. Moreover, there are no frameworks for coordinating these programs between employment and educational institutions, except for few individual initiatives.

4/3 ➤ The job market for university graduates suffers in both quantity and quality as indicated by unemployment, masked unemployment, and immigration on one hand and the low expectations from university graduates on the other hand. Economically, this problem is the result of 1) slow growth of the Lebanese economy and its inability to create new work opportunities and 2) the laxity of professional standards in many of its sectors. Educationally, this problem is reflected 1) in the expansion of higher education driven by political and commercial considerations at the expense of the quality of input and of learning outcomes of graduates; 2) not availing databases in education regarding labor market demands; 3) weakness of partnership and communication frameworks between educational institutions and employment institutions, and 4) lack of frameworks and clear efforts to develop fast training certificate programs.

#### **B. Providing a work force that is able to compete in globalized job markets**

11. Globalization has led to important changes in the job market due to colossal technological changes and to the flow of goods, funds, people, and information across borders. These changes have affected professions and professional standards. This new situation has forced institutions of higher education to re-examine their structures in relation to their programs, services offered, curriculum content, and relation with the world of work.
12. Higher education in Lebanon has witnessed changes in the structure and content of the curricula of many universities even though the focus in general remains on the specialization aspect. The professional training aspect in employing institutions is weak in terms of organization, content and evaluation. Moreover, the general preparation aspect of programs, which helps the graduate absorb any development and work under different conditions, remains weak. This general preparation aspect includes knowledge and thinking skills; professional management; social and psychological skills; and communicative skills in Arabic and foreign languages and professional ethics.
13. The curricula in a number of universities and vocational and technical education institutions suffer from a weakness in providing students with competencies related to the economic and administrative aspects of labor. There is deficiency in matters related to cost, product quality and standards for environment protection and environmentally clean production. There is also a deficiency in providing students with administrative competencies particularly those that relate to establishment of small or medium service and production establishments by individuals or a group of partners.
14. While professional as well as educational professional standards have become international in the form of cooperation between educational, training, and labor institutions, most of educational, technical, vocational, and higher education institutions in Lebanon remain outside those networks. This may make students forfeit the opportunity to acquire new skills and competencies and consequently their ability to compete.

4/4 ➤ Higher education and technical and vocational education in Lebanon exhibit serious problems in keeping pace with the global work market and in building a competitive workforce. These problems manifest themselves in a number of areas: 1) weakness of practical training; 2) weakness in general preparation that enables graduates to adapt to innovations; 3) weakness in aspects related to production according to international standards; 4) weakness in aspects related to initiatives in establishing institutions (entrepreneurship); 5) weakness in cooperation programs with international educational and employment in a specific specialization; 6) the absence of quality control and quality assurance frameworks based on

international standards for technical and applied university specializations; and 7) not availing information and studies about supply and demand trends for graduates, on the regional and international levels .

## Part V: Governance of Education

### A. Setting Up Frameworks

1. The Ministry of Education and Higher Education has not yet managed to provide enough reference documents that could serve as a guide for managing education and for defining policies, strategies, and plans.
2. In spite of all efforts to develop an educational strategy since the year 2000, the MEHE has not been able to adopt such a strategy on the basis of which educational plans will be developed<sup>91</sup>.
3. Throughout the past few decades, several educational plans have been drafted but not approved. The latest plans that were developed are the following: the Plan for Educational Reform<sup>92</sup>, the 5-year Plan for Reform of Vocational and Technical Education (1998-2002)<sup>93</sup>, and the Plan for Education for All. The first plan had been approved but was restricted to general education; its implementation was not done beyond the development of new curricula and new textbooks. The second plan has not been approved; the third plan has been in the development stage for a period of over three years, but has not made it beyond the draft form.
4. The Ministry has not developed enough specifications and standards to control quality in the administration or educational institutions. The monitoring systems in the Ministry are either purely administrative, weak, or restricted to one educational sector while neglecting others. Furthermore, there are no monitoring systems, and databases, if available, are not used for this purpose.
5. The MEHE has not yet set frameworks or standards for quality assurance for education in schools and universities in both the public and the private sectors. Despite the fact that many Arab countries and many other countries around the world have developed national organizations for quality assurance (or for accreditation) for education, Lebanon has not issued until now any legal document about this issue.
6. The organizational framework of the MEHE does not include any reference to legislations that could govern and ensure supporting and developing cooperation among educational institutions, between these institutions and civic society, or between the institutions and the job market. The limited cooperation that exists here and there is done either in an advisory capacity or on individual basis.  
**5/1 ➤ The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) has not been able to draw the necessary frameworks for effectively managing education in Lebanon. Such needed frameworks include: 1) policies, strategies and plans; 2) standards and specifications; 3) appropriate systems for monitoring and supervision; 4) quality assurance; and 5) means of supporting cooperation within the education society and between this society and other social institutions.**  
**5/2 ➤ The organizational structure and human resources of MEHE do not seem adequate for successfully carrying out its role of setting up frameworks for education in Lebanon.**
7. The MEHE has initiated cooperative (for example in developing the curricula) and consultative experience (through some of the committees and other bodies set up by a ministerial decree)<sup>94</sup> with the private sector and the civil society. However these efforts remained limited due to the absence of the appropriate laws that constitute the

organizational framework for partnership. The result of this is a weakening of the Ministry's effectiveness at the national level.

**5/3 ➤ The MEHE has witnessed partnership experiences with the private sector as well civic society; however, these experiences did not turn into a clear rule-governed system for national educational decision-making.**

### **B. Management**

8. The basis of the current organization of MEHE goes to 1959. Since then, the most prominent modifications that took place include the establishment of (CERD) in 1971. The decree to establish a unit for educational guidance and educational districts was issued, but the needed steps for its implementation were not taken and no modification in the organizational structure took place. On the other hand, the 1990's witnessed an attempt to split the Ministry of Education then into three ministries (vocational and technical education, culture and higher education, national education, youth, and sports). However, this organization was discontinued, and all these functions (except for culture and sports) were consolidated in one ministry.
9. The Ministry administers public education through two general directorates (one for general education, and one for vocational and technical education) and the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD). The General Directorate for Higher Education which was added later has no administrative powers. The many proposals to reform of the organization and management of MEHE that have been put forward during the last two decades were not adopted.
10. The functions of education remain scattered and do not follow one governmental administration. Some functions follow the MEHE. Others report to other authorities, such as the Ministry of Public Works (school buildings), the Council of Ministers (Educational Inspectorate), the Council for Development and Reconstruction (planning and school buildings), and the Council of the South (school buildings) etc., and there is also other ministries which have formal and non-formal education roles (Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Social Affairs, etc).
11. In view of what the country has gone through, the MEHE suffers from relative discontinuity and conflicts in authority among its units, which has decreased its efficiency. This decrease in efficiency is due partly to the structure of MEHE which did not adjust to the developments witnessed by the education sector in Lebanon in the past decades and to contemporary trends in the field of administration. This can be inferred from many of the weaknesses indicated in the strategic issues in the "Vision Document".
12. The MEHE is working through the Educational Development Project (EDP) on establishing an Educational Management Information System (EMIS) which is an integrated information system designed to serve the management information needs of general education and vocational and technical education in an effort to automate the MEHE. This system has many components: 1) Educational Management Information System (EMIS), 2) School Information System (SIS), 3) National education Network (NEN), 4) Geographical Information System (GIS/School Mapping), and 5) Information Management Unit (IMU). The IMU has been established and equipment and software are about to be procured<sup>95</sup>. Through the EDP, the MEHE is working on the automation of examinations by establishing a Question Bank System (QBS) and Examination Management System (EMS) and Examination Generating System (EGS)<sup>96</sup>.
13. All management issues in general education apply to vocational and technical education. There are, however three points to be noted. First, CERD has functions which benefit primarily general education: Curricula, textbooks, teacher training, educational research, setting school buildings specifications, planning etc. The General Directorates for



Vocational and Technical Education does all these functions by itself and sometimes in “cooperation” with CERD. This duality causes confusion in both sides. Second, the General Directorate for Vocational and Technical Education has initiated cooperation with the private sector which takes two forms: common projects and dual teaching. However, this experience has not been evaluated. Third, the higher technical education is run in a way similar to technical secondary education and this problem has been discussed in Part 2 of this document.

**5/4 ➤ The management of education suffers from: 1) scattered functions; 2) conflicts among the units which perform these functions and occasional lack of communication among them; and 3) traditional methods and lagging behind the educational developments in Lebanon and contemporary trends in educational management. The MEHE is developing management information systems so as to automate the Ministry.**

14. Although the National Accord Document adopted administrative decentralization (and regional balanced development), the effort exerted to apply this principle on government units reached a dead end and this applies to educational administration. The establishment of educational districts in 1974 achieve little change with regard to decentralization. With the exception of establishing the School Fund in public schools (in cooperation with parents and municipalities) to fund some needed school matters, most of the school activities are managed by central authority decisions. This situation renders the local authorities unconcerned with developing and supporting the school, and helping it to assume a role in its community.

**5/5 ➤ The management of education is centralized without partnership with the local community. It is also centered in such a way that school administrations are not given (except in few cases) adequate authority to manage their schools.**

15. Public schools are managed through instructions from the central administration. The school administration is not given the opportunity to choose its teachers or even express an opinion on the teachers that join or leave the school. Schools do not have financial plans or budgets and do not have any autonomy in their own planning or development and thus are not subject to social accountability. The centralization of management weakens the relation of the schools with the local authority and society especially in extra-curricular activities, common projects, and community service. The centralization constrains the school’s administrative and educational roles and removes the principals’ accountability regarding the consequences of their actions.
16. The school administration consists of a hierarchical structure consisting of the principal, the supervisors, and the teachers. Supporting services such as documentation, educational and technological resources, student psychological and social guidance, and cycle coordinators (or directors) are lacking with the exception of secondary schools which have subject coordinators.

**5/6 ➤ The MEHE has not yet proposed an educational vision in which the public school is allowed a special dynamism in its operation and development so that it becomes an active element in societal development; the school administration is not given the authority or responsibilities needed for self-management.**

17. The efficiency of the MEHE exhibits a weakness in terms of its financial resources. Based on the 2003-2004<sup>97</sup> statistical data, the cost per student in public education stands at 1,680 million LL. This cost is much higher than that of subsidized private education (0,812 million LL) but lower than that of the non-free private education (1,680 million LL). Of the above cost, the government covers 1,3 million LL per student in public schools, 0.3 million LL in private schools (in the form of scholarships to employees and the expenses of the MEHE unit on private education). In both cases, the remainder is shouldered by the parents<sup>98</sup>. On the surface, it looks like the cost of public education is not significantly different from that of non-free private education, but practically the cost of public education is considered rather high if we take into account the inequality in opportunities, success, educational continuation and quality of education, all of which tend to favor the private sector. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of financial resources and economic analysis of education.
18. The efficiency of the MEHE exhibits a weakness in managing its material resources. This is indicated by the poor use of school buildings of which some are under-utilized and others which are crowded and heavily used. It is also apparent in the complexity of operations and measures to maintain and fix school buildings. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of material resources.
19. There is a weakness in the efficiency of the MEHE in managing its human resources. This is indicated by the poor distribution of teachers, with shortage and excess at the same time; transferring teachers from schools that need them; assigning teachers tasks that are not in their job description, and assigning teachers to other ministries. In general the student-teacher ratio is considered low in public education (8,4) compared to private education (12,6)<sup>99</sup>, though this ratio in public schools varies according to geographical location becoming lower in rural areas because the Ministry is obliged to open schools for few number of students. There is no unit in the Ministry which deals with the administration of human resources.

**5/7 ➤ The MEHE administration of public education suffers from weaknesses in administering its financial, material and human resources. The current structure does not provide modern systems or frameworks for economic analysis, rationalizing expenditure, and managing financial resources.**

20. Human resources in charge of education in Lebanon lack the experience and qualifications needed for a proper and modern administration. The deficiency in human resources may explain the problems faced in curriculum development, teacher training, school supervision, school map development, and provision of support to schools in the application of the curricula and in the utilization of public teachers. The Ministry does not have today any clear standards or appropriate mechanisms that make it possible to appoint the right person in the right place, which leaves the door open for favoritism and political intervention.

**5/8 ➤ The units of the Ministry of Education and Higher Learning suffer from quantitative and qualitative deficiencies in specialized human experienced resources in the Ministry's functions and scope of operation.**

21. The Lebanese University (LU) falls under the trusteeship of the Minister and has academic, financial, and administrative independence. However, the law that governs its operation is almost 40 years old, having been issued in 1967. The many changes and developments which have taken place during this period rendered this law unsuitable and

consequently resulted in discrepancies between the law and the actual practices and requirements of the modern university administration.

22. Theoretically, the authority in LU is in the hands of academicians who run it. However, the position of the chairperson of the department is weak in the administrative structure because of insufficient authorities assigned to it such as not allocating a budget or assistant staff. In 1977, the position of “branch director” was established along with the branching of LU after the war broke out. Despite the fact that the authority of the branch director is limited to assisting the dean of the faculty (Decree no.810 dated 5/1/1978), the director in practice assumed the academic authority in the branch; chairing the branch council and replacing the chairpersons of departments in the unit council (in faculties that have branches).
23. The Lebanese University gradually lost much of its academic and administrative autonomy. This situation is first the result of an archaic University law, which does not include detailed and modern conditions for appointment in the University to ensure quality and transparency; second, the transfer of the authorities of the University Council to the Council of Ministers, particularly since 1996 and specially in the area of contracting full-time faculty members; and third, a surging tendency of politicians for making the University a field for competing for political influence and shares.
24. The current organization of the LU ensures collegiate participation in decision-making at all levels (Branch Council, Faculty Council, and University Council). The participation of students in decision-making is non-existent since the break of the war in 1975. On the other hand, the Association of the Full-time professors has been successful in securing representation of the faculty members.
25. LU lacks social partnership in managing its affairs. There are no economic, professional, or alumni representations neither at the executive nor at the advisory levels.
26. The LU lacks supporting administrative – academic structures that provide decision – makers with appropriate files and data to minimally allow the University to function as expected from a modern university. This includes drafting of strategies, plans, curriculum supervision, graduate studies and research, student affairs, external programs, measurement and assessment, administration of human, academic, and material resources and of campuses etc.
27. Except for financial affairs (salaries), the use of ICT is still very weak in the administration of the University and its colleges. Paper is still used for all transactions and data bases are non-existent even for students and faculty members. The use of computers in daily administrative matters is still very limited.
28. The administrative human resources in the LU lack the specialization needed for its operation and modern management of its affairs. In the past decades, hundreds of employees were appointed on a contractual discretionary basis. Sometimes tests were given to those and those who passed were offered regular appointment. For example, there are no specialists in documentation and finance specialists. There are no programs in the University to up-grade employees and those on contracts. Also there are no known efforts to change employment conditions to include appropriate specializations for the jobs<sup>100</sup>.

**5/9 ► The Lebanese University suffers from many problems in administration of its affairs: 1) diminished authority of academicians; 2) the University’s loss of it autonomy; 3) the absence of student participation at the Faculty and University level; 4) weak societal and professional partnerships to allow them to look into University matters; 5) lack of supporting administrative –academic structures; 6) weakness in ICT use 7) administrative human resources that lack proper modern and appropriate specializations; and, 8) non-existence of administrative units for human and material resources.**

**On the other hand, the current organizational structure of the LU ensures collegiate participation in decision-making.**

### **C. Relation with the Private Sector**

29. The history of private education in Lebanon dates far back, to a time way before the establishment of the Lebanese state. This made private education a source of power and pride for Lebanon. On the other hand, the Lebanese constitution guaranteed the freedom of education. But educational institutions, pre-university and higher education, confessional and private profit and non-profit, have grown in a haphazard fashion during the last decades, especially during the last 10 years.
30. Education, in both public and private sectors, is, by definition, a public interest, related to national wealth. The expression “looking after the public interest in private education” is intended to mean: 1) the existence of organizational frameworks for the operation of private education in a manner that serves public interests. This includes the rights of teachers and students and the right of students to acquire quality education that meets the set minimal specifications and standards, etc.; 2) the abiding of institutions of private education by these frameworks and controlling cases which harm public interest; and 3) the support of private efforts and initiatives that aim to improve the quality of education, to increase educational opportunities for the general population, and the support of activities that fall under national plans and educational development projects and programs.
31. The MEHE did not live up to its expected role of looking after the public interest in private education. Its role has been limited and so far has included conducting national examinations in general education, vocational and technical education, and higher technical education. It has also included keeping track of the names of students enrolled in private schools, offering financial support for public sector employees to help them send their children to private schools, and offering financial support to subsidized private schools. It is worth mentioning that the Ministry’s monitoring of subsidized private schools required by law has been absent during the last few years.

**5/10 ➤ There are clear shortcomings in the manner in which the MEHE is carrying out its duty of looking after public interest in private education in line with the spirit of the Lebanese constitution. These shortcomings are evident in: 1) weak organizational frameworks that govern this mentoring and its implications; 2) absence of overseeing procedures that ensure learners quality education based on a basic minimum standards of quality; 3) absence of support for the initiatives and efforts that lead to increased educational opportunities, improve the quality of education, and reinforce the role education plays in social integration and economic development; and 4) failure to call on private institutions to share in projects and educational development plans.**

## Notes

- <sup>1</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ٣٤، ص ١٥٦.
- <sup>٢</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ٣٣.
- <sup>٣</sup> بشور، نجلاء وآخرون (٢٠٠٢). رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ١٣٥-٢٠٤.
- <sup>٤</sup> بشور نجلاء وآخرون (٢٠٠٢). رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٥</sup> بشور، نجلاء وآخرون (٢٠٠٢). رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>6</sup> The study for the living conditions of families (2004) revealed that the net enrollment rate is 92.7% only at the elementary level. Yet the gross enrollment rate for students aged 5-9 and 10-14 (regardless of grade) is 98.6% and 95.2% respectively. This supports the high saturation hypothesis at that age
- (إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، ٢٠٠٦).
- <sup>٧</sup> إدارة الإحصاء المركزي (٢٠٠٦). الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر.
- <sup>٨</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ١٥٨، وص ١٩٥. هذه النسبة تتعلق بالتعليم العام فقط. ولكن أعداد المسجلين في التعليم التقني في هذه المرحلة صغير جداً مما لا يؤثر على النتيجة (١٨٩ ألف في التعليم العام و٦ آلاف في التعليم التقني).
- <sup>٩</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- <sup>١٠</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (٢٠٠٠). إلزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم الرسمي.
- <sup>١١</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (٢٠٠٠). إلزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم الرسمي، ص ٦٤؛ وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ١٨١-١٨٢، ص ١٩٧.
- <sup>١٢</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- <sup>١٣</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ٥٢-٥٧.
- <sup>١٤</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ١٨١-١٨٢، ص ١٩٧.
- <sup>١٥</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.

<sup>16</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي: مشروع الخطة الوطنية للتعليم للجميع (٢٠٠٥-٢٠١٥). بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، ص ص ١٨١-١٨٤، ص ص ١٩٦-١٩٨.

<sup>17</sup> According to the statement of the Minister of Education and Higher Education Dr Khaled Kabbani, newspapers, on 24 August 2006.

<sup>18</sup> خضر، عبد الفتاح (٢٠٠٥). "واقع تحصيل اللغة الأجنبية الأولى: قراءة في نتائج امتحانات الشهادة المتوسطة للسنوات الثلاث الأخيرة"، *المجلة التربوية*، عدد ٣٤، ص ٣٣.

<sup>19</sup> Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques**. Université Saint-Joseph.

<sup>20</sup> This rate was calculated on the basis of statistical estimates in the appendices of The Education for All Plan and on the basis of the Educational Statistics Bulletin (2004-2005).

<sup>21</sup> Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques**. Université Saint-Joseph.

<sup>22</sup> ٤١,٢٢١ في التعليم التقني (المسجلون في الشهادات الرسمية) و ١١٥,٦٧٠ في التعليم العام (المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥).

<sup>23</sup> The percentage of registered students in the second year – Sciences in public education is 42.5% compared to 57.5% in private education. The percentage of students in the humanities in the public sector is 67.3% compared to 32.7% in the private sector

(المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام الدراسي ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥).

<sup>24</sup> The concentration of industrial and agricultural specialties in public education is attributed to the financial cost of such education. One of the causes of the dominance of humanities specialties in public general education may be the selective nature of private general education.

<sup>25</sup> المصري، عصام: "مكتنة الامتحانات الرسمية"، *المجلة التربوية*، عدد ٣٢، ص ص ٤٧-٤٩.

<sup>26</sup> Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques**. Université Saint-Joseph.

<sup>27</sup> Among them is the Canadian Hariri University Complex for Sciences and Technology which recently became a university. See:

المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥

We have classified institutions as universities or institutes according to their founding decrees, while taking into consideration the fact that based on these decrees, some institutions do not appear in the Center's statistics, whereby the total becomes 42 higher education institutions.

<sup>28</sup> أنظر بالنسبة للمعلومات عن العاميين ٢٠٠٠/١٩٩٩ و ٢٠٠٤/٢٠٠٥، النشرتين الإحصائيتين الصادرتين عن المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء للعاميين المذكورين.

<sup>29</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، النشرة الإحصائية للعام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥.

<sup>30</sup> Humanities here include the following domains: literature, social and political sciences, rights, education, arts, journalism, and documentation.

<sup>31</sup> الأمين، عدنان (إشراف) (١٩٩٧). *التعليم العالي في لبنان*. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

- <sup>32</sup> الجامعة اللبنانية (٢٠٠٤). التقييم الذاتي في الجامعة اللبنانية-الجزء الأول: التقرير التوليقي. بيروت: منشورات الجامعة اللبنانية.
- <sup>33</sup> الأمين، عدنان وآخرون (١٩٩٩). قضايا الجامعة اللبنانية وإصلاحها. بيروت: دار النهار للنشر والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>34</sup> سليم، مريم (٢٠٠٢). "المنهج الرسمي لرياض الأطفال في لبنان"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ٢١٣.
- <sup>35</sup> Each time, the curriculum mentions the Arabic language in parallel with the foreign language. Considering the linguistic goals that the child should learn the mother tongue skillfully for expression and communication, the nationality of that tongue is however not mentioned...whether it is Arabic, French, Armenian, Kurdish, English or German. In the theoretical guide, it is mentioned that the mother tongue is the language which children speak at home with their parents and states in parentheses that it is "neither formal Arabic nor a foreign language", see:
- حطيط، فادية (١٩٩٩). "نظرة في منهج رياض الأطفال"، في: المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان: نظرة تقويمية. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ١٠٨-١٠٩.
- <sup>36</sup> سليم، مريم (٢٠٠٢). "المنهج الرسمي لرياض الأطفال في لبنان"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>37</sup> قانون ٤٤٢ تاريخ ٢٩/٧/٢٠٠٢.
- <sup>38</sup> بشور، نجلاء (٢٠٠٢). "واقع رياض الأطفال في لبنان"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ١٨٦-١٨٩.
- <sup>39</sup> بشور، نجلاء (٢٠٠٢). "رياض الأطفال في لبنان: واقع وتحديات"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ٤٢٩.
- <sup>40</sup> مقلد، سمر (٢٠٠٢). "التقييم والعلاقة مع الأهل في مرحلة الروضة"، في: رياض الأطفال في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ٣٢١.
- <sup>41</sup> ومن هذه الأعمال مشروع تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان: نظرة تقويمية والذي نفذته الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية بين ٢٠٠١ و٢٠٠٣. أنظر أيضاً: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (٢٠٠٣). التوصيات الصادرة عن هيئة متابعة خطة تقييم وتطوير الهيكلية والمناهج التعليمية. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- <sup>42</sup> This project in a previous stage (1993-1998) had another orientation, whereby it meant by comprehensive education, "global education" geared at all classes in basic education.
- <sup>43</sup> سنو، عبد الرؤوف (إشراف) (٢٠٠٣). تقويم تجربة التربية الشمولية في لبنان. بيروت: كلية التربية-الجامعة اللبنانية.
- <sup>44</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٣). المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>45</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٢). المكون الخامس: تقييم نظام التقييم. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

- <sup>٤٦</sup> هل يتراجع مستوى التعليم في لبنان، ص ٦. المكون السادس: تقييم تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٤٧</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٢). المكون الخامس: تقييم نظام التقييم. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٤٨</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٣). المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٤٩</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، مكتب الإعداد والتدريب.
- <sup>٥٠</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي (٢٠٠٤). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي، ص ١٣٠.
- <sup>٥١</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٢). المكون السابع: تقييم برامج تدريب المعلمين. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>52</sup> Comité Technique pour la Formation Continue (2001). **Projet pour la mise En Place d'un dispositif permanent de formation continue des enseignants**. Lebanon: CRDP.
- أنظر أيضاً:
- Gibler, Jean-Marc et Hoyek, Samir (2000). **Formation continue des enseignants** (sous composante 2.2), Document de projet.
- <sup>٥٣</sup> أنظر خطط العمل المناطقية للاعوام ٢٠٠٤-٢٠٠٥، ٢٠٠٥-٢٠٠٦، مكتب الإعداد والتدريب، المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.
- <sup>٥٤</sup> وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي (٢٠٠٤). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي ومشروع الإنماء التربوي، ص ٦٣.
- <sup>55</sup> According to the statement of Minister of Education and Higher Education Dr. Khaled Kabbani, newspapers, on 24 August 2006.
- <sup>٥٦</sup> دراسة رابطة أساتذة التعليم الثانوي في لبنان عام ٢٠٠١.
- <sup>57</sup> Ayoubi, Z. & Boujaoude, S. (2006). **Chemistry teachers' practices in public and private schools in Beirut**. Paper presented at the Conference on Preparing Teachers for the Third Millennium, Al-Isra Private University, Amman, Jordan, May 18 and 19;
- Henningsen, M.A. & Zebian, S. (2003). **High-level thinking, reasoning, and communication in Lebanese elementary mathematics classrooms: A preliminary technical report on the 2002-2003 classroom observations of the MARAL project**.
- <sup>58</sup> TIMSS (2003). **User Guide**.
- <sup>٥٩</sup> الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠١). المكون السادس: تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- Studies had been conducted in the 1990's on educational achievement and reached the same results.
- أنظر: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي (٢٠٠٠). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان للعام ٢٠١٥. لبنان: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، ص ٢٧.
- <sup>٦٠</sup> البنك الدولي (٢٠٠٦). "هل يتراجع مستوى التعليم في لبنان؟"، نشرة البنك الدولي-الفصل الأول.



- <sup>٦١</sup> الأمين، عدنان (إشراف) (١٩٩٧). **التعليم العالي في لبنان**. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٦٢</sup> الأمين، عدنان (تحرير) (٢٠٠٥). **ضمان الجودة في التعليم العالي**. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٦٣</sup> الجامعة اللبنانية (٢٠٠٤). **التقييم الذاتي في الجامعة اللبنانية-الجزء الأول: التقرير التوليقي**. بيروت: منشورات الجامعة اللبنانية.
- <sup>٦٤</sup> رابطة الأساتذة المتفرغين. **تذخر مجلة أوراق جامعية بالمقالات والتقارير المقدمة من الهيئة التنفيذية لرابطة الأساتذة المتفرغين في الجامعة اللبنانية للرابطة إلى مجلس المندوبين**. أنظر أيضاً: رابطة الأساتذة المتفرغين في الجامعة اللبنانية، المكتب الإقليمي لليونسكو في بيروت، والاتحاد العالمي لنقابات المعلمين (٤-٦ شباط ١٩٩٨). **مؤتمر دور الجامعة في مجتمع متنوع-حالة لبنان**، بيروت.
- <sup>٦٥</sup> الأمين، عدنان وآخرون (١٩٩٩). **قضايا الجامعة اللبنانية وإصلاحها**. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية. أنظر أيضاً: دندشلي، مصطفى (محرر) (د.ت.). **الجامعة اللبنانية واقعها ومستقبلها**، وقائع ورشة العمل التي نظمتها ندوة العمل الوطني صباح السبت الواقع في ٧ حزيران ١٩٩٧، بيروت: منشورات ندوة العمل الوطني.
- <sup>٦٦</sup> PNUD/UNESCO (1995). **Eléments de diagnostic du système d'enseignement supérieur et l'Université Libanaise**. Document de Travail.
- <sup>٦٧</sup> [www.escwa.org.lb/reports/docs/Lebanon\\_2005](http://www.escwa.org.lb/reports/docs/Lebanon_2005).
- <sup>٦٨</sup> Moral reasoning is the logic used by the individual to address moral issues. Kolbert was the first to measure it by way of presenting a number of hypothetical moral dilemmas and concluded that moral reasoning involved three stages and two steps in every stage. This is considering that moving from stage to stage and step to step occurs through learning.
- <sup>٦٩</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٣). **المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية؛ اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠١). **المكون السادس: تقييم تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٧٠</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٣). **المكون الثاني: تقييم مناهج المواد**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٧١</sup> بيضون، أحمد (١٩٨٩). **الصراع على تاريخ لبنان أو الهوية والزمن في أعمال مؤرخينا المعاصرين**. بيروت: منشورات الجامعة اللبنانية.
- <sup>٧٢</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٢). **المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٧٣</sup> These are dependent on local and international religious authorities and on the countries in which civil marriage is conducted.
- <sup>٧٤</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٢). **المكون الثالث: تقييم الكتب المدرسية**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٧٥</sup> اليونسكو والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠١). **المكون السادس: تحصيل تلامذة التعليم العام في لبنان**. تقييم المناهج التعليمية الجديدة في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.
- <sup>٧٦</sup> بدر، ميشال (٢٠٠٥). **مفاهيم حقوق الإنسان (والطفل) في مناهج التعليم العام في لبنان (دراسة توثيقية)**، المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (تقرير غير منشور).

<sup>٧٧</sup> الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (١٩٩٨). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

<sup>٧٨</sup> الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (١٩٩٨). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

<sup>٧٩</sup> سوزان عبد الرضا (منسقة) (١٩٩٨). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

<sup>٨٠</sup> الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (١٩٩٨). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

<sup>81</sup> Majzoub, Hana (1999). **The Socioeconomic Background of AUB Students and their Career Decisions**. Diplôme d'Etudes Supérieures en Education. Beirut.

<sup>٨٢</sup> سوزان عبد الرضا (منسقة) (١٩٩٨). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية.

<sup>83</sup> The indicator of the economic and educational levels drops for students' parents from 3.27 points in one of the private universities to 22 points in the faculties of the unified Lebanese University to 13 and 14 points in the third, fourth, and fifth branches of the University.

أنظر: الأمين، عدنان ومحمد فاعور (١٩٩٨). الطلاب الجامعيون في لبنان: إرث الانقسامات. بيروت: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، ص ١٠٥.

<sup>84</sup> An exception is the effort of the Lebanese Association for Educational Studies in 2004, whereby it organized, for the first time in this field, a collective national conference that encompassed some 400 educational institutions. During the conference, different cases of marginalization within the school were presented, as was the effectiveness of some of the educational and psychological measures taken to deal with these cases. Also presented were initiatives and inquiries on the methods of handling or preventing such cases.

أنظر: الهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية (٢٠٠٤). الأولاد المهمشون داخل المدرسة في لبنان. بيروت، تقرير غير منشور.

<sup>85</sup> The figures occurring under this title and dating back to 1970 are cited from:

مديرية الإحصاء المركزي (١٩٧٢). القوى العاملة في لبنان-تحقيق إحصائي بالعينه-تشرين الثاني ١٩٧٠

The figures dating back to 1997 are cited from:

إدارة الإحصاء المركزي (١٩٩٨). الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر في عام ١٩٩٧.

The figures dating back to 2001 are cited from:

Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des Jeunes Libanais dans la Vie Active et L'émigration**. Université Saint Joseph.

The figures dating back to 2004 are cited from:

إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، ٢٠٠٦.

<sup>٨٦</sup> وزارة الشؤون الاجتماعية وبرنامج الأمم المتحدة الإنمائي (١٩٩٨). خارطة أحوال المعيشة في لبنان، بيروت.

<sup>87</sup> Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques**. Université Saint Joseph.

The study of living conditions estimates the unemployment rate at 7.9% and also demonstrates that unemployment among university graduates is less than unemployment among holders of intermediate school certificates. This variation in the givens may be attributed to emigration in general and emigration of youth in particular

(إدارة الإحصاء المركزي، الأوضاع المعيشية للأسر، ٢٠٠٦).

<sup>88</sup> Kasparian, Choghig (2003). **L'entrée des jeunes libanais dans la vie active et l'émigration, La population Libanaise et ses caractéristiques**. Université Saint Joseph.

<sup>89</sup> أنظر: عيسى، نجيب (٢٠٠٠). التعليم العالي وسوق العمل في لبنان. أسكوا، منظمة العمل الدولية، مؤسسة الوطنية للاستخدام (غير منشورة).

<sup>90</sup> أنظر: وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي (٢٠٠٠). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان للعام ٢٠١٥. لبنان: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، ص ص ٦٩-٧٠.

<sup>91</sup> It has designed the following strategy projects:

- المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (٢٠٠٠). التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان ٢٠١٥، بيروت.

- وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي، مشروع الإنماء التربوي (٢٠٠٤). مشروع التوجهات الاستراتيجية للتربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت.

- وزارة التربية والتعليم العالي (٢٠٠٦). استراتيجية التربية والتعليم في لبنان. بيروت.

<sup>92</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء (١٩٩٤). خطة النهوض التربوي في لبنان. بيروت: المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء.

<sup>93</sup> وزارة التعليم المهني والتقني (١٩٩٨). الخطة الخمسية لتطوير التعليم المهني والتقني (١٩٩٨-٢٠٠٢)

(٢٢٢ صفحة). وكانت قد وضعت قبلها خطة أخرى. أنظر: وزارة التعليم المهني والتقني (١٩٩٣). خطة

النهوض بالتعليم المهني والتقني خلال عقد التسعينات (٨٨ صفحة). أنظر حول أحوال التخطيط في لبنان:

العلم، ديالا (٢٠٠٤). تطوير هيكلية وزارة التربية الوطنية في لبنان (١٩٥٠-٢٠٠٠). رسالة دبلوم دراسات

عليا في التربية، كلية التربية.

<sup>94</sup> مثال: الهيئة التربوية الوطنية (قرار رقم ٢٢٠٢/٣/٢٠٠٢).

<sup>95</sup> Education Development Project/EDP. **Newsletter**, November 2006.

<sup>96</sup> Education Development Project/EDP. **Newsletter**, November 2006.

<sup>97</sup> Ministry of Education and Higher Education/EDP (2006). **Survey Report and Analysis of Results**. Helsinki Consulting Group. Lebanon.

<sup>98</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء ووزارة الوطنية والشباب والرياضة (٢٠٠٠): **إلزامية التعليم في لبنان: الحاجة إلى التعليم الرسمي**، ص ص ٩٢-٩٤.

<sup>99</sup> المركز التربوي للبحوث والإنماء، **النشرة الإحصائية للعام الدراسي ٢٠٠٤/٢٠٠٥**. هذه النسب محتسبة على أساس عدد جميع المعلمين، المعينين في الملاك والمتعاقدين وغيرهم.

<sup>100</sup> See management issues in the Lebanese University:

الأمين، عدنان وآخرون (١٩٩٩). **قضايا الجامعة اللبنانية وإصلاحها**. بيروت: دار النهار والهيئة اللبنانية للعلوم التربوية، الفصل التاسع والفصل العاشر.

