Good Governance at the
Lebanese University:
Experience from the Public Sector

Pascale Salameh, PharmD, MPH, PhD
Quality Representative of the Lebanese University
Member of the Quality and Accreditation Committee
Governance definition

• **Governance** is defined by the way in which an organization is managed at the highest level, and the systems for doing this.

• **Good governance** is defined by Kaufmann, Kraay, and Mastruzzi (2004; 2007) as the “traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised for the common good”.

• **Principles** of good governance as described by the UNDP:
  - Legitimacy and voice: participation and consensus orientation
  - Direction: strategic vision for improvement
  - Performance: responsiveness and effectiveness and efficiency
  - Accountability: accountability and transparency
  - Fairness: equity and rule of law
Governance and Performance Fundamentals in Educational Governance (World Bank, 2009)

- **Standards** are transparent and publicly known criteria or benchmarks used to assess and inform education policy, provision, and performance.

- **Incentives** are any financial or non-financial factors that motivate a specific type of behavior or action, and can be positive or negative, i.e. encourage a certain behavior or deter it.

- **Information** in the form of clear definitions of outputs and outcomes combined with accurate data on performance and results collected at regular intervals enables sanctions to be imposed when specified standards are not met.

- **Accountability** refers to the act of holding public officials/service providers accountable for processes and outcomes and imposing sanctions if specified outputs and outcomes are not delivered.
Overview of the Educational Governing Process

Ministry of education: 
Education policy

Provider performance

Service delivery quality & Education outcomes

Parliament: 
Government policy

Local government

Beneficiaries & Stakeholders

The Lebanese University

• The Lebanese University is the only Public University in Lebanon
• More than 81,000 students
• Educates 40-50% of university students in Lebanon
• Includes 19 faculties and institutes
• Sections and branches distributed all over Lebanese regions
• Diversity of programs: sciences, health, humanities, literature, arts, technology, engineering, economy, management, law...
• Relative autonomy; under the tutorship of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education
Mission of the Lebanese University

• The mission of the Lebanese University is to:
  • Provide continuous training and quality public education,
  • Ensure a general culture within the Lebanese society,
  • Provide services to the society,
  • Provide quality education of scientific managers,
  • Strengthen citizenship in the Lebanese nation,
  • Educate its followers on moral and human values.
Values/Principles of the Lebanese University

• An open and inclusive approach: Equality of opportunity
• The interests of students: Promotion of knowledge, learning and research → Competency adaptation to the labor market
• Institutional autonomy, within an accountability framework: Outcome → The social and economic interests of Lebanon.
• Openness, fairness and transparency: clear laws and regulations
• Commitment to evidence based policy development: ongoing institutional research
SWOT: Strength Points of the Lebanese University

**INTERNAL**
1) Financial, administrative and academic autonomy.
2) Qualified Teaching Body.
3) Adoption of the LMD system.
4) Various resources are available to Students.
5) Wide national and international collaboration.
6) Sufficient quality culture within UL.
7) Experiences in various national and international projects on quality assurance.

**EXTERNAL**
1) Only public university on the whole Lebanese territory.
2) the University enjoys a satisfactory national and international reputation.
3) International aspect is very well established.
4) Evolutionary Creation of University Campuses.
5) Stable budget till recently.
| INTERNAL         | 1) Lack of collective democratic governance experience.  
                   | 2) University Council with three functions (executive, legislative, legal).  
                   | 3) Significant discrepancy in teachers’ involvement in research.  
                   | 4) Absence of Students in all governance bodies.  
                   | 6) Budgeting difficulties for renting the buildings.  
                   | 7) Lack of competent administrative staff.         |
|------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| EXTERNAL         | 1) External political and religious influence.  
                   | 2) Insufficient budget, and decreasing.  
                   | 3) Insufficient national culture about the importance of research.  
                   | 4) Recruitment seized by the government.  
                   | 5) Political instability.  
                   | 6) Difficulties to establish plans over several years. |
# Strategy & Governance SWOT analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal (Organizational)</th>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Clear and Comprehensive Mission and Strategic Guidelines</td>
<td>1. 1st experience of institutional accreditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Qualified faculty members, multi-languages and multi-nations (recruitment basis)</td>
<td>2. Collective and democratic governance still evolving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Highly diversified educational offer; quality programs (relative autonomy)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Students of various backgrounds; contribution to the development of the distant regions of Lebanon</td>
<td>3. Communication of components without real coordination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>External (Environmental)</th>
<th>Opportunities</th>
<th>Threats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. University is spreading all over Lebanon: inclusiveness (remote areas campuses; diverse socioeconomic status students)</td>
<td>1. Politico-religious environment influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Optimizing national and international interactions with various stakeholders</td>
<td>2. Insufficient visibility with respect to the website (lack of information / transparency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Image of leader in public education</td>
<td>3. Heterogeneous outcomes (accountability versus autonomy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. Incentives are insufficient (Public budget)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quality Management at the Lebanese University

• Advantages:
  • Quality has always been a concern
  • Quality of teaching: recruiting the best professors with the highest degrees in various specialties
  • Quality of research:
    • High number of PhD holders willing to do research
    • Availability of a research strategy
  • Quality of services: laboratories and outreach facilities

• Disadvantages:
  • Quality was not structured enough within the system
  • Sporadic initiatives in some faculties: program accreditation from international agencies (CIDPHARMEF, WFME, IDA, ABET)
  • Need for more systematic/strategic approach??
TLQAA: The Suggested Lebanese Quality Standards

- 2013: TEMPUS project → TLQAA (Towards the Lebanese Quality Assurance Agency)
- The Lebanese University contribution:
  - Generation of Lebanese educational quality standards
  - Elaboration of a self-assessment guide by the Central Quality and Accreditation committee
  - Diffusion to all faculties by the Central Quality and Accreditation committee
  - Implementation ongoing in some faculties
## TLQAA Suggested Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CORE STANDARD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Elements</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Goals and Objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Governance (organization, administration, decision-making, institutional assessment, planning)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Teaching and Learning (teaching models, learning outcomes, evaluation, students achievement, graduates employability and competitiveness)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Academic Programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. General Resources (library and information, physical, technological, financial resources)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Human Resources (faculty and staff)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Students (admission and retention, services and support)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Principles</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Public Disclosure (visibility, transparency, documentation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Integrity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Official Lebanese Standards

• 2014: Higher Education law #285 voted by the Parliament on May 8, 2014

• 2018: Diffusion of an adapted version of the standards by the Universities Association of Lebanon and the Ministry of Education and Higher Education:
  → 8 standards & corresponding guidelines

• The Lebanese University started self assessment in some faculties based on these standards
ISO Certification of Students’ Affairs Services

• Lebanese Ministry of Economy and Trade’s initiative in 2013: funding of ISO certification of some public structures
• Lebanese University: student’s affairs services certification
• Involved faculties: Public Health, Pharmacy, Tourism and Information
• Quality Management System of these services organized at the central level according to ISO9001 – version 2008 standards
• Students’ affairs services were certified for the consecutive years: 2015, 2016, 2017, 2018
QMS at the Lebanese University

• A structure was established for the QMS
• Policies and procedures were generated for the activities of the students’ affairs services
• Forms for standardization of procedures were generated and used
• Assessment of services by students was conducted; corrective measures were taken accordingly
• Certification by external auditors was earned
• Central administration in 2018: continue and spread the project; change of standards (ISO9001 – version 2015 standards).
Institutional Accreditation Diagram

Follow-up

Self-Study

Visit

Assess

Focus on Learning

Implement

Reassess

Plan

Pascale SALAMEH. PharmD, MPH, PhD, HDR
Institutional Accreditation: Hcéres

- In 2017: Initiative of the French Embassy & the AUF to fund the accreditation process by the Hcéres
- Hcéres: 6 areas for evaluation
  - Strategy and governance
  - Research and education
  - Student academic pathways
  - External relations
  - Management
  - Quality and ethics
- Hcéres in Lebanon:
  - Evaluation/accreditation of foreign institutions and programs
  - Several universities in Lebanon
Hcéres at the Lebanese University

- Lebanese University as an institution → Accreditation project
- Institutional accreditation obtained on December 1st 2018 for 3 years
Perspectives for Quality Improvement

• Creation of the Central Offices for Quality, Research & Teaching.

• Reactivate the students’ participation in university governance.

• Encourage the creation of Alumni for all faculties.

• Initiate quality indicators’ assessment for the Lebanese University.

• Encourage faculties to initiate programs’ accreditation with appropriate international agencies.
Thank You